

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Criminal Justice in Need of a Paradigm Shift . . . . .</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	The Current Situation of Victims' Rights in Europe: Common Rights Without a Common Rationale . . . . .	1
1.2	A State-Centred Versus a Human-Rights Based Approach . . . . .	3
1.3	Conceptualising the Victim . . . . .	9
1.3.1	The Witness Paradigm . . . . .	9
1.3.2	The Economic Model: The Damaged Victim as Civil Party . . . . .	13
1.3.3	The Harm Paradigm: The Harmed and Vulnerable Victim in Need and Deserving of Support, Protection and State Compensation . . . . .	15
1.3.4	Private Accusation and the Victim's Right to Enforce Public Prosecution . . . . .	21
1.3.5	The Rights Paradigm . . . . .	22
1.3.6	Victims' Primary, Secondary and Tertiary Rights . . . . .	23
1.4	The Emerging Paradigm: States' Duty to Combat Impunity . . . . .	24
1.4.1	In Need of a Paradigm Shift . . . . .	24
1.4.2	The Fundamental Inconsistency Between the Traditional Paradigm and Victims' Rights . . . . .	24
1.4.3	The Necessity to Depart from Substantive Criminal Law . . . . .	26
1.5	First Seismic Activity . . . . .	28
1.5.1	A Notable Root-Cause: Anti-Authoritarian Scepticism . . . . .	28
1.5.2	First Indications of a Paradigm Shift at the International Level . . . . .	30
1.5.3	The Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR) . . . . .	32
1.5.4	The European Court of Human Rights on States' Obligations to Protect Rights . . . . .	33

1.5.5	States' Obligations to Protect by Means of Enacting and Enforcing Criminal Law Provisions . . . . .	35
1.5.6	The ECtHR's Two Approaches to Criminal Law . . . . .	41
1.5.7	Relations Between the Procedural Aspects and Article 13 ECHR . . . . .	42
1.5.8	Criminal Justice Serving to Eradicate Impunity of Grave Human Rights Violations . . . . .	45
1.5.9	The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court . . . . .	47
1.5.10	Recent Developments at State Level . . . . .	48
1.6	Affirmative Versus Critical Criminal Law Doctrine . . . . .	51
1.6.1	Deterrent Punishment Disregards the Victim . . . . .	52
1.6.2	Deterrent Punishment Disregards the Offender . . . . .	53
1.6.3	Kant's Principle . . . . .	54
1.6.4	Affirmative Criminal Law Doctrine . . . . .	56
1.6.5	Human Dignity and Human Rights as Limitations of Criminal Law . . . . .	58
1.6.6	The Victim's Rights Alone Cannot Justify the Punishment of the Offender . . . . .	60
1.6.7	Conclusion and Outlook . . . . .	61
	References . . . . .	62
<b>2</b>	<b>Punishment and Human Sociality . . . . .</b>	<b>65</b>
2.1	Why Punish? Three Questions to Explore . . . . .	65
2.2	The Ultrasociality Riddle . . . . .	67
2.3	Public Goods, Free Riding and Punishment in Game-Theory Experiments . . . . .	70
2.3.1	In a Public Goods Game, Peer Punishment Enables a Group's Cooperation . . . . .	70
2.3.2	The Crucial Role of Third Parties: Punishment is Premised on an Emerging Normative Consensus . . . . .	72
2.3.3	A Norm is a Public Good . . . . .	75
2.4	The Inherent Psychology of Punishment . . . . .	78
2.4.1	Hypothesizing: Deterrent Punishing Versus Retribution . . . . .	78
2.4.2	Deterrence Does Not Hold the Answer (I) . . . . .	80
2.4.3	Betrayal Aversion and Conditional Cooperation . . . . .	81
2.4.4	Punishment is a Second-Order Public Good . . . . .	86
2.4.5	Non-strategic, Expressive Punishment Driven by Strong Emotions . . . . .	87
2.5	Punitive Sentiments . . . . .	89
2.5.1	The Central Concern: the Wrong Suffered by the Victim . . . . .	90
2.5.2	Indignation and Just Desert . . . . .	92
2.5.3	The Inclination to Punish Defectors Bonds with Sympathy for Victims . . . . .	93

2.6	The Genetic and Neural Basis of Punishing . . . . .	95
2.6.1	Flexible Social Norms and Persistent Punishing . . . . .	96
2.6.2	Multilevel Selection . . . . .	97
2.6.3	Gene-Culture Coevolution (GCC) . . . . .	98
2.6.4	Dual Inheritance Theory and the Normative Animal . . .	100
2.6.5	Ostracism . . . . .	104
2.6.6	Empathic Reactions of Newborns and Infants' Sympathy for Victims . . . . .	106
2.6.7	Infants' Aversion Against Obstructive Behaviour and Appreciation of Punishment . . . . .	108
2.6.8	'Inherent' and Conventional Wrong . . . . .	110
2.6.9	The Neural Basis of Retributive Punishment . . . . .	110
2.7	The Mechanism of Punishment . . . . .	112
2.7.1	The Semantics of Punishing: Punishment as Censure . . .	112
2.7.2	Punishment as Hardship . . . . .	114
2.7.3	Sharing in the Costs of a Norm: The 'Fairness' of Punishment . . . . .	116
2.7.4	Deterrence Does Not Hold the Answer (II) . . . . .	118
2.7.5	For Comparison: Deterrent 'Punishing' in Animals . . . .	121
2.7.6	'Mutualism' and 'Nosism' . . . . .	123
2.8	In Conclusion: Why Punish? . . . . .	126
	References . . . . .	131
<b>3</b>	<b>Human Dignity: The Right to be a Person . . . . .</b>	<b>139</b>
3.1	What this Chapter is About: Human Dignity and its Development . . . . .	139
3.2	Kant and the Concept of Innate Human Dignity . . . . .	144
3.2.1	Human Beings Existing in Nature and Culture . . . . .	147
3.2.2	Freedom, Autonomy and Dignity . . . . .	148
3.2.3	Legislation Based on Human Dignity . . . . .	150
3.2.4	God's Voice as Innate Conscience . . . . .	153
3.2.5	Political Implications . . . . .	157
3.3	Body, Soul and Agency . . . . .	160
3.3.1	Orders of Consciousness . . . . .	161
3.3.2	The 'I' . . . . .	162
3.4	Fichte and Human Dignity as the Right to be a Person and to Partake in Human Culture . . . . .	164
3.4.1	The Dignity of All Who Carry a Human Face . . . . .	165
3.4.2	Fichte's Theory of Calling ( <i>Aufforderung</i> ) . . . . .	168
3.4.3	The Concept of a Human Being is the Concept of Humankind . . . . .	174
3.4.4	Fichte on the Cosmopolitan Right "to go about freely on the earth" . . . . .	176
3.4.5	The Socialised Person . . . . .	179
3.4.6	Society's Call Prompts Agency . . . . .	184
3.4.7	Generating a Normative Order . . . . .	186

3.4.8	Individuation . . . . .	195
3.4.9	The Crucial Importance of Fichte's Concept of Human Dignity . . . . .	198
3.5	The Development of Human Rights . . . . .	201
3.5.1	The First Generation: Liberal Constitutionalism and Human Rights as a Subject's Private Freedom . . . . .	202
3.5.2	The Second Generation: Liberal Nation States and Human Rights as the Political Rights of Equal Citizens . . . . .	203
3.5.3	The Third Generation: the Welfare State and Social Rights . . . . .	205
3.5.4	The Fourth Generation: Solidarity of Humankind and Universal Rights in a Global Order . . . . .	207
3.6	Human Dignity Overcoming Collectivism and Nationalism . . . . .	211
3.6.1	Individualism and Universal Rights . . . . .	213
3.6.2	The Sovereign Nation . . . . .	217
3.6.3	The Sovereign Individual . . . . .	219
3.7	The Second Enlightenment: from Liberal Democracy to a Humanist Society . . . . .	224
3.7.1	The Mistake of Innate Autonomy and Unrestricted Moral Relativism . . . . .	225
3.7.2	In Need of a Second Enlightenment . . . . .	227
3.7.3	The Evolution of the Normative Order . . . . .	229
3.7.4	Alienating Socialisation . . . . .	232
3.7.5	Particularistic Morality and Totalitarianism . . . . .	241
3.7.6	Defending the Preconditions of a Humanist Society . . . . .	244
3.7.7	The Primacy of Human Dignity and Human Rights: Humanism Overcoming Unconstrained Majoritarianism . . . . .	250
3.8	Human Dignity as the Foundation and Guiding Principle of a Global Humanist Society . . . . .	255
3.8.1	Human Dignity and Human Rights are Normative Categories . . . . .	258
3.8.2	The Structure of a Global Humanist Society . . . . .	261
3.8.3	Horizontal Societal Differentiation Fostering Pluralism . . . . .	264
3.9	Human Rights and Obligations . . . . .	265
3.9.1	Respect and Care . . . . .	266
3.9.2	Formation Rights and Corresponding Obligations . . . . .	268
3.9.3	Care Rights . . . . .	270
3.9.4	Autonomy Rights . . . . .	271
3.9.5	Resource Rights . . . . .	273
3.9.6	Rights are to be Practically Effective . . . . .	274
3.9.7	The Effectivity of Rights is Premised on a Decent Social Order . . . . .	275
3.10	In Conclusion: Why Human Dignity? . . . . .	276

3.10.1	Why Normativity? . . . . .	277
3.10.2	The Crucial Challenge: Legitimising Normativity Under Conditions of Modernity . . . . .	278
3.10.3	Dignity Norms and Conventional Norms . . . . .	281
3.10.4	Making a Virtue of Necessity . . . . .	282
	References . . . . .	284
<b>4</b>	<b>Criminal Justice Respecting Human Dignity . . . . .</b>	<b>293</b>
4.1	What this Chapter is about . . . . .	293
4.1.1	Restrictions Inherent in a System of Criminal Justice Founded on Human Dignity . . . . .	295
4.1.2	Establishing the Truth, Convicting, Sentencing and Punishing Offenders . . . . .	296
4.1.3	Criminal Justice in Transition from a Nation State Paradigm to a Humanist Society . . . . .	298
4.2	The Nation State: Criminal Law Unleashed . . . . .	299
4.2.1	Franz von Liszt . . . . .	299
4.2.2	Ernst Beling . . . . .	301
4.2.3	Overcoming the Nation State in Criminal Law . . . . .	303
4.3	A Fresh Start: Human Dignity and the Principle of Guilt . . . . .	305
4.3.1	The Paradox of Deterrence . . . . .	305
4.3.2	Calling on the Offender . . . . .	307
4.3.3	Human Dignity, the Principle of Guilt and Limits of European Integration . . . . .	309
4.4	The Offender's Right to be Held to Account . . . . .	312
4.4.1	Choosing Punishment? . . . . .	312
4.4.2	Fichte's "Expiation Contract" and a Citizen's Right to be Punished . . . . .	315
4.4.3	Max Scheler: Punishment as Atonement and Reconciliation . . . . .	317
4.4.4	A Right to Hardship? . . . . .	319
4.4.5	Expiation and the Nation State . . . . .	321
4.4.6	The Justification of Punishment . . . . .	322
4.5	Defining the Limits of Criminal Law . . . . .	323
4.5.1	Kant Does Not Hold the Answer . . . . .	323
4.5.2	Criminal Law and Punishment Limited to Preserving Dignity Rights . . . . .	324
4.5.3	Criminalisation: the Message Sent by Criminal Law . . .	328
4.5.4	The Scope of Criminal Law Based on Human Dignity . . .	329
4.5.5	Criminal Law Relating to Different Categories of Human Rights . . . . .	332
4.6	A Crime Victim's Secondary Rights . . . . .	333
4.6.1	Right to Non-recurrence . . . . .	334
4.6.2	Right to be Treated with Care and Respect . . . . .	335
4.7	A Killed Victim's Right to the Punishment of Her Murderer . . .	336
4.8	The Victim's Right to Justice . . . . .	341

4.8.1	Right to the Truth . . . . .	344
4.8.2	Right to the Conviction of Offenders . . . . .	345
4.8.3	Right to the Punishment of Offenders and to the Compensation of Damages . . . . .	346
4.8.4	Right to Access Justice . . . . .	347
4.9	The Relation Between the Victim's and the Offender's Rights . . .	347
4.10	Restoring the Offender's Full Status as a Member of Her Legal Community . . . . .	348
4.10.1	Punishment as Hardship . . . . .	349
4.10.2	Criminal Justice Serves the Offender's Formation . . . . .	351
4.10.3	Punishment: Exclusion or Inclusion? . . . . .	352
4.10.4	The Offender's Right to Her Full Rehabilitation . . . . .	355
4.11	Everyone's Right to the Security of Their Rights . . . . .	356
	References . . . . .	357
<b>5</b>	<b>Differences Between Traditional Criminal Justice and a Human Dignity Based Approach . . . . .</b>	<b>363</b>
5.1	Justice for Victims, Offenders and All Others: the Line of Argument . . . . .	363
5.1.1	The Incompatibility Between the Traditional Concept of Criminal Justice and Victims' Participation in Proceedings . . . . .	363
5.1.2	A New Paradigm and Start-Up Difficulties . . . . .	365
5.1.3	The Animal That Punishes . . . . .	366
5.1.4	Human Dignity as the Right to be a Person . . . . .	366
5.1.5	Criminal Justice Supporting the Formation of Persons . . .	368
5.2	The Deep Roots of the Traditional State-Centred Paradigm . . . . .	369
5.2.1	Deontological Versus Consequentialist Ethics . . . . .	369
5.2.2	Consequentialism in Ethics and Legal Theory . . . . .	371
5.2.3	Empiricism and Objectivity . . . . .	372
5.2.4	Is There an Escape from Consequentialism? . . . . .	373
5.3	From Technical Rationality to Lively Communication . . . . .	374
5.3.1	Criminal Justice as a System of Acts of Communication . . . . .	374
5.3.2	From Manipulation to Conviviality: Making Criminal Justice a Participatory Institution . . . . .	376
5.3.3	The Promise of Objectivity and the Myth of the Vindictive Victim . . . . .	378
5.3.4	Criminal Justice as Restoration of the Normative Order and the Persons Concerned . . . . .	381
5.4	In Conclusion . . . . .	384
	References . . . . .	386
	<b>Table of Cases . . . . .</b>	<b>389</b>
	<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>395</b>