

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1	A Plea for the Philosophical Study of Family Law.....	1
1.2	A Typology of Family Law .....	4
1.3	Jurisprudence vs Philosophy of Law.....	6
1.4	Plan of the Book.....	7
	References.....	9
 <b>Part I Law, Morals and the Constitution</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Natural Law Theory</b> .....	13
2.1	Positive and Natural Law .....	13
2.2	The End of Miscegenation: <i>Loving vs. Virginia</i> .....	15
2.2.1	Historical Background .....	15
2.2.2	Factual Basis of the Case .....	16
2.2.3	Decision and Findings of the U.S. Supreme Court .....	17
2.3	Traditional Natural Law Theory.....	18
2.3.1	An Example of Traditional Natural Law Theory: John Locke.....	18
2.3.2	Assessing Traditional Natural Law Theory in the Context of Family Law .....	23
2.4	Modern Natural Law Theory: Lon Fuller .....	26
2.4.1	Principles of Legality .....	26
2.4.2	The Inner Morality of Law.....	27
2.4.3	The Social Purposes of Law.....	27
2.4.4	Objections to Fuller.....	28
2.5	Contemporary Natural Law Theory: Ronald Dworkin .....	28
2.5.1	Rules and Principles.....	29
2.5.2	Principles as Natural Law .....	30
2.5.3	Objections to Dworkin .....	31
	References.....	33

<b>3</b>	<b>Legal Positivism</b> .....	35
3.1	The Separation of Law and Morals.....	36
3.2	Rape and Forced Marriage in Morocco.....	36
3.3	Traditional Legal Positivism: John Austin.....	37
3.3.1	Law as Sovereign Commands.....	37
3.3.2	Legal and Moral Validity.....	38
3.4	Assessment of Austin.....	41
3.4.1	Are Marriage Laws the Commands of a Sovereign?.....	41
3.4.2	Are Child Custody Laws the Commands of a Sovereign?.....	43
3.5	Modern Legal Positivism: H.L.A. Hart.....	45
3.5.1	Law and the Obligations Created by Law.....	45
3.5.2	The Key to Understanding the Nature of Law.....	46
3.5.3	The Application of Hart's Theory to Family Law.....	47
3.5.4	Objections to Hart's Theory.....	49
3.6	Hart's Compromise: The Minimum Content of Natural Law.....	51
3.7	Minimum Content of the Rules of Family Law.....	52
3.7.1	Rules of Marriage.....	53
3.7.2	Rules Protecting Infants and Young Children.....	54
3.7.3	Rules of Custody Assignments at Birth.....	54
	References.....	57
<b>4</b>	<b>Constitutional Interpretation</b> .....	59
4.1	The Concept of "Person" in the Constitution.....	60
4.2	Three Supreme Court Family Law Cases.....	63
4.2.1	Parent's Right to Control Their Child's Education: <i>Meyer v. Nebraska</i> (1923).....	63
4.2.2	Children's Rights of Free Speech: <i>Tinker v. Des Moines School District</i> (1969).....	65
4.2.3	Marital Privacy: <i>Griswold v. Connecticut</i> (1965).....	68
4.3	The Role of <i>Stare Decisis</i> in Supreme Court Decision-Making.....	69
4.4	Theories of Constitutional Interpretation.....	72
4.4.1	Originalism.....	73
4.4.2	Non-originalism.....	79
	References.....	86
 <b>Part II State Intervention in the Family</b>		
<b>5</b>	<b>The Moral Limits of Family Law</b> .....	91
5.1	Legal Intervention in the Family.....	91
5.2	Is "Family" a Political Concept?.....	94
5.2.1	Relationship of Family Law to the Concept of Family.....	96
5.2.2	Resolving the Dispute Between Traditionalists and Radicals.....	99

5.3	Theories of Legal Intervention and Their Application to Family Law .....	100
5.3.1	Utilitarianism and the Harm Principle .....	100
5.3.2	Paternalism .....	105
5.3.3	Moralism .....	107
5.4	Testing the Limits of Intrafamily Sexual Behavior .....	111
	References .....	113
<b>6</b>	<b>Family Crime and Punishment</b> .....	<b>115</b>
6.1	Public and Private Harms .....	115
6.2	Intrafamily Crimes: Justifications for Punishment .....	116
6.2.1	Punishment as Deterrence .....	117
6.2.2	Punishment as Retribution .....	120
6.3	Therapy, Not Punishment .....	123
	References .....	126
<b>7</b>	<b>Child Abuse and Neglect</b> .....	<b>127</b>
7.1	Protecting the Child: The Family Court Option .....	127
7.2	Two Cases .....	128
7.3	The Standard of “Best Interests of the Child” .....	129
7.4	Using Family Models to Determine the Best Interests of a Child .....	132
7.4.1	Family Preservation vs Child Protection .....	134
7.4.2	Compassion vs Control .....	135
7.5	An Alternative Dispositional Standard .....	137
	References .....	140
<b>8</b>	<b>Family Torts and Remedies</b> .....	<b>143</b>
8.1	Tort Liability and Remedies .....	144
8.2	Philosophical Questions About Torts and Tort Remedies .....	146
8.3	Theories of Justification for Tort Remedies .....	148
8.3.1	Corrective Justice .....	149
8.3.2	Retributive Justice .....	150
8.3.3	Distributive Justice .....	151
8.4	Intrafamily Torts and Immunities .....	152
8.4.1	Parental Tort Immunity .....	152
8.4.2	Interspousal Tort Immunity .....	155
8.5	Summary: Limits of Tort Intervention .....	158
8.6	Standards of Care in Intrafamily Negligence Torts .....	161
8.6.1	Objective and Subjective Standards of Care .....	162
8.6.2	H.L.A. Hart’s Two-Question Proposal for Determinations of Negligence .....	164
8.6.3	Objections to Hart’s Proposal: Standards of Care for Children .....	164
8.6.4	An Alternative Approach: Sub-categorization .....	165
	References .....	168

**Part III Marriage, Children and the State**

<b>9</b>	<b>Family Contracts: Marriage and Divorce</b> .....	171
9.1	A Conversation About Marriage: Past and Present.....	172
9.2	Traditional Marriage: Rights, Duties and Benefits.....	173
9.3	Justice and the Distribution of Marital Benefits and Burdens.....	174
9.3.1	Egalitarian Principles.....	175
9.3.2	The Difference Principle.....	176
9.3.3	Utility-Based Principles.....	177
9.4	Legally Gendered Marriage.....	179
9.5	Access to Marriage.....	181
9.5.1	The Public Debate.....	181
9.5.2	The Constitutional Debate.....	184
9.6	Alternatives to Traditional Marriage.....	186
9.6.1	Contract Law and the Abolition of Legal Marriage.....	187
9.6.2	Marital Contracts as Private Contracts.....	187
9.6.3	Minimal Marriage.....	188
9.6.4	Assessing the Alternatives to Traditional Marriage.....	190
9.7	The Exit Rules.....	191
9.7.1	Divorce and the Vulnerability of Women.....	193
9.7.2	Divorce and the Vulnerability of Young Children.....	195
	References.....	200
<b>10</b>	<b>Children, Parents and the State</b> .....	203
10.1	The Custodial Status of Children.....	204
10.2	Philosophical Theories on the Status and Rights of Children.....	204
10.2.1	A Typology of Rights.....	205
10.2.2	Parents as Owners of Children: Thomas Hobbes.....	206
10.2.3	The Perfect Freedom of Children: Herbert Spencer.....	207
10.2.4	Parents as Temporary Custodians: John Locke and J.S. Mill.....	209
10.2.5	Criticisms of Locke and Mill.....	211
10.3	Constitutional Theories About the Rights of Children.....	212
10.3.1	Socially Inappropriate Speech: <i>Bethel v Fraser</i> .....	214
10.3.2	“Reasonable” Censorship of Children’s Speech: <i>Hazelwood v Kuhlmeier</i> .....	215
10.4	The Supreme Court’s Dilemma of Classification.....	217
10.4.1	Limited Scope Rights.....	218
10.4.2	Rights-to-Be-Balanced.....	220
10.4.3	Rights-in-Trust.....	221
	References.....	225

**Part IV Contract and Property Disputes Arising  
from Alternative Birth Methods**

<b>11 Surrogacy</b> .....	229
11.1 The Internal Oracle of Justice .....	230
11.2 Two Surrogacy Cases .....	231
11.2.1 <i>In re Baby M</i> (1987) .....	231
11.2.2 <i>Johnson v. Calvert</i> (1993) .....	232
11.3 The Biological Preference Principle and the Language of Surrogacy .....	232
11.4 Traditional Rules of Contract Law .....	234
11.5 Natural Law .....	235
11.6 Utilitarian Concerns .....	237
11.6.1 Best Interests of the Newborn Child .....	237
11.6.2 Interests of Parents and State .....	239
11.7 Exceptions to the Biological Preference Principle .....	240
11.8 Utilitarian Objections to Surrogate Mother Contracts .....	242
11.9 Kantian Objections: Selling Babies and Renting Bodies .....	244
11.9.1 Selling Babies .....	244
11.9.2 Renting Bodies .....	245
References .....	248
<b>12 Frozen Embryos</b> .....	249
12.1 Divorce and Cryopreserved Embryos .....	249
12.2 Four Cases .....	250
12.3 <i>A.Z. v. B.Z.</i> : A Closer Look .....	251
12.4 The Right to Procreate .....	252
12.5 The Right not to Procreate .....	254
12.5.1 Interpretations of the Right not to Procreate .....	254
12.5.2 Application to Legal Decisions .....	255
12.6 Appeals to Utility .....	258
12.7 Non-discretionary Standards .....	260
12.8 Pre-IVF Contracts .....	260
12.9 Limits on the Content of Pre-IVF Contracts .....	262
12.9.1 Forced Procreation .....	262
12.9.2 Interests of Future Persons .....	264
References .....	266

**Part V Alternative Approaches to the Philosophy of Law**

<b>13 Critical Legal Studies and Feminist Jurisprudence</b> .....	269
13.1 Formalism and Legal Realism .....	269
13.2 Critical Legal Studies .....	272
13.2.1 Legal Reasoning .....	273
13.2.2 <i>Stare Decisis</i> and the Rule of Law .....	276
13.2.3 Family Privacy .....	277
13.3 Feminist Legal Theory .....	277
References .....	282