

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxviii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xli
<i>List of Figures</i>	xlix
<b>Chapter I: Historical Overview: The Road from Early Prosecutions of War Crimes to the Creation of the ICC</b>	<b>1</b>
A. The Versailles Peace Treaty and Historical Precedents	1
B. The First Ad Hoc Tribunals: Nuremberg and Tokyo	4
(1) The trials against the major war criminals of Germany and Japan	5
(2) Post-Nuremberg WWII trials	7
(3) The Nuremberg Principles as the immediate consequence of the Nuremberg Trials	9
C. The Development of International Criminal Law Prior to the Establishment of the UN Ad Hoc Tribunals	10
(1) The Genocide Convention	10
(2) The Hague and Geneva laws	11
(3) The Draft Codes of the International Law Commission	16
(4) Private initiatives	18
D. The UN Ad Hoc Tribunals	19
(1) The International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	19
(2) The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	22
E. The International Criminal Court	23
(1) Negotiating history	23
(2) The Rome Statute, the structure of the Court and other legal instruments	25
(a) General	25
(b) The judges	26
(c) The Office of the Prosecutor (OTP)	29
(d) Registry, and Assembly of States Parties	31
(e) Legal sources	32
(f) The first Review Conference in Kampala	34
(3) Current investigations	35
(a) Situations and triggers	35
(b) From situations to cases	37
F. The 'Mixed' Tribunals	40
(1) The legal bases	40
(a) Kosovo	41
(b) East Timor	42
(c) Sierra Leone	43
(d) Cambodia	44
(e) Iraq	46
(f) Lebanon	48
(g) Bangladesh	50
(2) Comparative analysis	51

<b>Chapter II: Concept, Function, and Sources of International Criminal Law</b>	54
A. Concept, Meaning, and Object of International Criminal Law	54
B. Punitive Power, Overall Function, and Purposes of Punishment	56
(1) The punitive power ( <i>ius puniendi</i> ) of the international community	57
(2) The overall function of (international) criminal law	60
(a) The theoretical starting point: protection of ‘Rechtsgüter’ and prevention of harm	60
(b) The transfer to international criminal law	65
(3) On the purposes of punishment <i>stricto sensu</i>	67
(a) Traditional theories	67
(b) International criminal law	68
C. Sources and Methods of Interpretation	73
<b>Chapter III: Imputation and General Structure of Crime in International Criminal Law</b>	81
A. A General Part of International Criminal Law	81
B. Imputation in International Criminal Law	83
(1) Individuals acting in a collective context	84
(2) Individual responsibility	86
C. Fundamental Principles: Legality, Culpability, and Fairness	87
(1) Legality	88
(2) Culpability	93
(3) Fairness	95
D. The Structure of Crime	97
(1) Preliminary remarks: the nature of crime and the question of ‘the system’	97
(2) The structure of crime in ICL	99
<b>Chapter IV: Individual Criminal Responsibility</b>	102
A. The Recognition of Individual Criminal Responsibility in International Criminal Law	102
B. Historical Case Law on Individual Criminal Responsibility in ICL	103
(1) The Nuremberg, Tokyo, and UNWCC trials	103
(a) The applicable law	103
(b) Objective elements of individual responsibility ( <i>actus reus</i> )	105
(i) Causal connection?	105
(ii) Participation/complicity	106
(iii) Expansion of attribution	108
(1) Command responsibility	108
(2) Conspiracy	110
(3) Membership in a criminal organization	111
(c) Subjective elements of individual responsibility ( <i>mens rea</i> )	112
(2) Selected judgments on Nazi crimes, and other state-sponsored criminality	113
(a) Objective elements of responsibility ( <i>actus reus</i> )	113
(i) Participation, in particular perpetration by virtue of an organization	113
(ii) Others	118
(b) Subjective elements of responsibility ( <i>mens rea</i> )	119
C. The Modern Law on Individual Criminal Responsibility	120
(1) Preliminary remarks	120
(2) Article 7(1) ICTYS and Article 6(1) ICTRS	121

(a) 'Direct' commission: physical and co-perpetration	121
(b) 'Indirect' commission I: joint criminal enterprise	123
(c) 'Indirect' commission II: aiding and abetting	127
(d) Incitement to commit genocide	132
(e) Delimitation of co-perpetration and aiding and abetting	134
(3) Mixed tribunals	135
(a) The applicable law	135
(b) The case law	136
(i) The Special Panels of East Timor	136
(ii) The Special Court for Sierra Leone	138
(iii) The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia	140
(iv) The Iraqi Special Tribunal	141
(v) The Special Tribunal for Lebanon	142
(4) Article 25 ICC Statute as the central provision on individual criminal responsibility in modern ICL	144
(a) Preliminary remarks: the law of participation and Article 25(3)	144
(b) Detailed analysis of paragraph 3	148
(i) Forms of perpetration (subparagraph (a))	148
(1) Direct perpetration	148
(2) Co-perpetration	149
(3) Perpetration through another person, in particular organizational control (' <i>Organisationsherrschaft</i> ')	154
(4) Special consideration: joint criminal enterprise (JCE)	160
(ii) Complicity I: encouragement (subparagraph (b))	163
(iii) Complicity II: assistance (subparagraph (c))	164
(iv) Responsibility extension I: other contribution to group crime (subparagraph (d))	166
(v) Responsibility extension II: incitement to commit genocide (subparagraph (e))	170
(vi) Participation and the crime of aggression (paragraph 3 <i>bis</i> )	171
(vii) Complicity after commission	171
(viii) Special consideration: JCE III and fundamental principles of criminal law	172
(c) Conclusions and perspectives	176
<b>Chapter V: Omission, in Particular Command Responsibility</b>	<b>180</b>
A. Rationale, Concept, and Forms of Omission	180
B. Is There General Omission Liability ( <i>Commission Par Omission</i> ) in ICL?	189
(1) The sources: written and case law	189
(2) Commission by omission as a rule of customary law or a general principle?	193
(3) Conclusion	197
C. Omission Liability Proper: Command Responsibility	197
(1) Preliminary remarks	197
(2) Article 7(3) ICTYS and Article 6(3) ICTRS	199
(3) Mixed tribunals	203
(4) Article 28 ICC Statute	206
(a) Preliminary remarks	206
(b) Objective requirements of superior responsibility	208
(i) The status of the superior	208
(ii) Effective 'command and control' or 'authority and control'	210
(iii) Crimes as a 'result' of the superior's failure to exercise control properly	215
(iv) 'Necessary and reasonable' countermeasures 'within his or her power'	217

(c)	Subjective requirements of superior responsibility	220
(i)	Military and non-military superior: positive knowledge	220
(ii)	Military superior: 'should have known'	221
(iii)	Non-military superior: 'consciously disregarded information which clearly indicated . . .'	227
(d)	Special issues	228
(i)	Command responsibility and ordering	228
(ii)	Command responsibility and JCE	229
(iii)	Command responsibility and the principle of culpability	230
(iv)	Command responsibility in <i>non</i> -international armed conflicts	232
<b>Chapter VI: Attempt as a Special Form of Individual Criminal Responsibility</b>		<b>233</b>
A.	General Considerations	233
(1)	Why punish attempt?	234
(2)	History of attempt in international criminal law	235
(3)	Definition (Article 25(3)(f) ICC Statute)	236
(4)	Crimes subject to attempt liability in ICL	238
B.	The Essential Elements of Attempt in Comparative Law as a Basis for ICL	240
(1)	Incompletion of the offence	241
(2)	Subjective requirement: intent to commit the crime (intent or fault element)	243
(3)	Objective requirement (conduct element)	245
(a)	Comparative law: common and civil law approaches	245
(b)	Conclusion: no 'magic formula' to determine the commencement of attempt	251
C.	The Correct Approach to the ICC Statute's 'Commencement of Execution': a Formula of Approximation	252
D.	Application to ICL Core Crimes (Articles 5–8 ICC Statute)	256
(1)	Genocide (Article 6), including incitement and general (secondary) participation	256
(2)	Crimes against humanity (Article 7)	259
(3)	War crimes (Article 8)	262
(4)	Crime of aggression (Article <i>8bis</i> )	263
E.	Abandonment	264
F.	Conclusion	265
<b>Chapter VII: The Subjective Requirements of International Crimes</b>		<b>266</b>
A.	The General Mental Requirement: Intent and Knowledge (Article 30 ICC Statute)	266
(1)	Preliminary remarks and terminological clarifications	266
(2)	The subject matter or objects of reference of Article 30 in general	270
(a)	The general object of reference of the mental element: material elements	270
(b)	The specific objects of reference of the mental element: 'conduct', 'consequence', and 'circumstance'	271
(3)	The standard or degrees of the mental element	274
(a)	With regard to 'conduct'	274
(b)	With regard to 'consequence'	275
(c)	With regard to 'circumstance'	276
(d)	Are lower standards than 'intent' and 'knowledge' sufficient?	276
(4)	The object of reference of the mental element with regard to the specific crimes (Articles 6–8 ICC Statute)	278
(a)	Genocide (Article 6)	279
(b)	Crimes against humanity (Article 7)	280
(c)	War crimes (Article 8)	283

(5) The object of reference of the mental element with regard to the forms of participation (Article 25 ICC Statute)	288
(6) The mental element and normative elements of the offence	289
B. Additional or Different Subjective Requirements Pursuant to the ‘Unless Otherwise Provided’ Formula	291
(1) Preliminary remarks	291
(2) Genocide (Article 6 ICC Statute)	292
(a) ‘Intent to destroy’	292
(b) Underlying acts of genocide	294
(3) Crimes against humanity (Article 7 ICC Statute)	295
(4) War crimes (Article 8 ICC Statute)	297
(5) Modes of participation (Article 25(3) ICC Statute)	299
C. Conclusion	300
<b>Chapter VIII: Grounds Excluding Responsibility (‘Defences’)</b>	<b>301</b>
A. Introduction	301
B. Classification of Defences	302
(1) Substantive and procedural defences	302
(2) Full and partial defences	303
(3) Justifications and excuses	304
(4) Failure of proof defences and alibi	307
(5) Hierarchy of defences	308
C. Substantive Defences	311
(1) Preliminary conceptual questions	311
(a) Substantive defences in ICL	311
(b) Relevant point of time	312
(c) Standard and burden of proof	312
(d) Application of defences by the ICC	314
(2) Mental disease or defect (Article 31(1)(a) ICC Statute)	314
(a) The insanity defence in national criminal law	314
(b) The insanity defence in the international jurisprudence	319
(c) The approach of the ICC Statute	320
(d) Obstacles to proof and the role of expert witnesses	323
(3) Intoxication (Article 31(1)(b) ICC Statute)	324
(a) The intoxication defence in national criminal law	324
(b) The intoxication defence in the international jurisprudence	327
(c) The approach of the ICC Statute	328
(4) Self-defence and defence of others (Article 31(1)(c) ICC Statute)	330
(a) Self-defence in national criminal law	330
(b) The differentiation between state and private self-defence	334
(c) The applicability of private self-defence in ICL	336
(d) Self-defence in the international jurisprudence	337
(e) The approach of the ICC Statute	338
(5) Duress and necessity (Article 31(1)(d) ICC Statute)	342
(a) Duress/necessity in national criminal law	342
(b) Duress/necessity in the international jurisprudence	348
(i) Nuremberg jurisprudence	348
(ii) Post-Nuremberg jurisprudence	349
(iii) Recent international jurisprudence with a special focus on the <i>Erdemović</i> case	352
(c) The approach of the ICC Statute	356
(i) Threat of death or serious bodily harm	356
(ii) Necessary and reasonable reaction	359

(iii) Subjective requirements	359
(iv) Special considerations applicable to the killing of innocent civilians	361
(6) Mistake of fact and mistake of law	366
(a) Mistake in national criminal law	366
(b) Mistake in the international jurisprudence	368
(c) The approach of the ICC Statute	370
(i) Mistakes concerning the elements of an offence	370
(ii) Mistakes concerning defences	374
(iii) Critical assessment of the <i>error iuris</i> rule	375
(7) Superior order	376
(a) Superior order in the international jurisprudence	377
(b) The approach of the ICC Statute	379
(8) Other defences	386
(a) Consent of the victim	387
(b) Military necessity	388
(c) Reprisals	390
(d) Tu-quoque principle	393
D. Procedural Defences	393
(1) Preliminary conceptual questions	393
(2) The <i>ne bis in idem</i> principle	396
(a) National <i>ne bis in idem</i>	396
(b) Transnational <i>ne bis in idem</i>	399
(c) International <i>ne bis in idem</i>	401
(3) Immunities	406
(a) General remarks	406
(b) Types of immunities	407
(c) Immunity as a procedural defence	410
(d) Immunity for international crimes?	411
(i) Vertical immunity (vis-à-vis international criminal tribunals)	413
(ii) Horizontal immunity (interstate level)	417
(4) Amnesties, pardons, and other waivers of punishment	419
(a) The need for a proportionality test	420
(b) Consequences for amnesties: two approaches	422
(i) Blanket amnesties: strict approach	422
(ii) Conditional amnesty: flexible approach	425
(c) Consequences for international tribunals	426
(5) Other procedural defences	427
(a) Statute of limitations	427
(b) Exclusion of jurisdiction over juveniles	430
(c) Incompetence/unfitness to stand trial	432
(d) Abuse of process	434
<i>General Literature</i>	438
<i>Index of Names</i>	445
<i>Index of Subjects</i>	448