

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
1.1	Research Questions . . . . .	1
1.2	Structure of the Thesis . . . . .	2
1.3	Terminology . . . . .	3
<b>2</b>	<b>State Responsibility and the Criminal Liability of the Individual</b> . . .	5
2.1	Nuremberg: Setting the Stage . . . . .	5
2.2	International Criminal Law: A Collision of Legal Systems . . . . .	11
<b>3</b>	<b>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</b> . . . . .	19
3.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	19
3.2	<i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and Domestic Law . . . . .	19
3.3	The Four Guarantees of <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> . . . . .	20
3.4	Theoretical and Philosophical Foundations . . . . .	21
3.5	<i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and the IMT Nuremberg and the IMTFE Tokyo . . . . .	23
3.6	<i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and Post World War II US Military Tribunals . . . . .	29
3.7	Changing the Picture? <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> and Its Inclusion in Human Rights Law and Humanitarian Law Conventions . . . . .	31
3.8	The Obligation of International Criminal Tribunals to Comply with <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> . . . . .	36
3.9	<i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> in International Criminal Law: A <i>sui generis</i> Principle? . . . . .	39
3.10	The Guarantees of the <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i> Principle in International Criminal Law: The Principle of <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Iure</i> . . . . .	42
3.10.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	42
3.10.2	The Quest for Applicable Law . . . . .	43

3.10.3	The <i>scripta</i> Requirement and the Sources of International Law: International Conventions as the Sole Legal Basis for Individual Criminal Responsibility? . . . . .	45
3.10.4	The <i>stricta</i> Requirement and the Sources of International Law . . . . .	48
3.10.5	The <i>praevia</i> Requirement and the Sources of International Law . . . . .	51
3.10.5.1	The Shift from Substantive Justice to Strict Legality . . . . .	51
3.10.5.2	The <i>praevia</i> Requirement and International Conventions . . . . .	53
3.10.5.3	The <i>praevia</i> Requirement and General Principles of Law . . . . .	58
3.10.5.4	The <i>praevia</i> Requirement and Customary International Law . . . . .	61
3.10.6	The <i>certa</i> Requirement and the Sources of International Law . . . . .	66
3.10.6.1	The Two Facets of the <i>certa</i> Requirement . . . . .	66
3.10.6.2	The <i>certa</i> Requirement as an Imperative for Improvement . . . . .	66
3.10.6.3	The <i>certa</i> Requirement as a Safeguard Requirement for the Individual . . . . .	67
3.10.6.3.1	The <i>certa</i> Requirement and the Moral Blameworthiness . . . . .	68
3.10.6.3.2	The <i>certa</i> Requirement and the General Sense of the Underlying Criminality . . . . .	69
3.10.6.3.3	The <i>certa</i> Requirement and the Concrete Underlying International Criminal Norm . . . . .	70
3.10.6.3.4	Legal Assessment of These Three Approaches to Establish the <i>certa</i> Requirement . . . . .	71
3.10.6.4	The <i>certa</i> Requirement and Customary International Criminal Law . . . . .	75
3.11	Concluding Remarks on the Principle of <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Iure</i> . . . . .	84
<b>4</b>	<b>The Formation of Customary International Law and Its Methodological Challenges . . . . .</b>	<b>87</b>
4.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	87
4.2	Traditional Customary International Law . . . . .	94
4.2.1	State Practice Under a Traditional Interpretation . . . . .	94
4.2.2	Opinio Iuris Under a Traditional Interpretation . . . . .	95
4.2.3	Traditional Customary International Law: Practical Concerns and Its Slow Development . . . . .	100

4.3	Modern Customary International Law . . . . .	102
4.3.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	102
4.3.2	The Procedural Aspect of Modern Customary International Law . . . . .	103
4.3.3	The Substantive Aspect of Modern Customary International Law . . . . .	106
4.4	The Identification of Customary International Law: The Challenge Ahead . . . . .	112
4.5	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	115
<b>5</b>	<b>The Role of Judges When Determining Customary International Law . . . . .</b>	<b>117</b>
5.1	The Initial Position: Being a Judge in the 1990s . . . . .	117
5.2	The Role of Judges: Determining, Developing or Creating Customary International Criminal Law? . . . . .	118
<b>6</b>	<b>Methodological Approaches to Customary International Law by International Criminal Tribunals . . . . .</b>	<b>125</b>
6.1	The Disclosure of the Method . . . . .	125
6.2	A Word of Caution . . . . .	127
6.3	Detectable Approaches to Customary International Criminal Law . . . . .	128
6.3.1	The Traditional Two Elements Approach . . . . .	128
6.3.1.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	128
6.3.1.2	ICTY <i>Tadić</i> Appeals Chamber Jurisdiction Decision . . . . .	131
6.3.1.3	High Frequency and High Consistency of State Practice . . . . .	134
6.3.1.4	Denying the Existence of Customary International Criminal Law on the Basis of the Traditional Two Elements Approach . . . . .	137
6.3.2	Non-allocation to Elements Method . . . . .	142
6.3.3	Deductive Approach . . . . .	145
6.3.3.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	145
6.3.3.2	Value-Based Deductive Approach and Deduction from Technical Humanitarian Principles . . . . .	145
6.3.3.3	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	155
6.3.4	Methodological Shortcuts: The Case Law Approach . . . . .	156
6.3.4.1	Preliminary Remarks . . . . .	156
6.3.4.2	Case Law as a Genuine “Subsidiary” Source of Law . . . . .	157
6.3.4.3	International Case Law as Subsidiary Means for the Determination of Customary International Law . . . . .	159
6.3.5	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	172

<b>7</b>	<b>Relevant Material for Proving the Existence of Customary International Criminal Law</b>	173
7.1	Preliminary Remarks	173
7.2	Official Pronouncements by States	177
7.3	Passive Practice	180
7.4	National Legislation	180
7.4.1	Preliminary Remarks	180
7.4.2	International Crimes Laws and National Criminal Codes	181
7.4.3	Military Manuals and Military Penal Codes	183
7.5	International Conventions	185
7.5.1	Preliminary Remarks	185
7.5.2	Humanitarian Law Conventions	191
7.5.3	Other Statutes of International Criminal Tribunals	193
7.5.3.1	Statutes of the IMT, IMTFE and Control Council Law No. 10	193
7.5.3.2	Statutes of the ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and ECCC	196
7.5.3.3	Rome Statute	197
7.5.4	Other International Conventions	199
7.5.5	Concluding Remarks	201
7.6	UN Resolutions	201
7.6.1	Preliminary Remarks	201
7.6.2	UN General Assembly Resolutions	202
7.6.2.1	UN General Assembly Resolutions as a Law-Creating Process	202
7.6.2.2	UN General Assembly Resolutions as Law-Determining Agencies	207
7.6.3	UN Security Council Resolutions	212
7.7	Jurisprudence	214
7.7.1	Preliminary Remarks	214
7.7.2	International Court of Justice	214
7.7.3	IMT Nuremberg and Post World War II Tribunals Operating Under the Strength of Control Council Law No. 10	219
7.7.4	Domestic Case Law	225
7.8	International Law Commission	227
7.9	Writings of Legal Doctrine	228
7.10	Concluding Remarks	230
<b>8</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	231
	<b>List of References</b>	239