

Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| 1 Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 Torture At Abu Ghraib. | 1 |
| 1.2 Outlining the Issue. | 2 |
| 1.3 The Occasion | 2 |
| 1.4 Methodology and Limitations | 3 |
| 1.5 Definitions | 4 |
| 1.6 Structure of the Book. | 6 |
| References | 7 |
| | |
| 2 The Theory of Mistake of Law in National Criminal Law Systems | 9 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 9 |
| 2.2 Mistake of Law in the Common Law Systems of the USA and the UK. | 10 |
| 2.2.1 Introduction: Ignorantia Legis Non Excusat | 10 |
| 2.2.2 The Exceptions to the Rule | 10 |
| 2.2.2.1 American Law | 10 |
| 2.2.2.2 English Law. | 18 |
| 2.2.3 Conclusion: An Ad Hoc Approach | 24 |
| 2.3 Mistake of Law in the Civil Law Systems of Germany and France | 25 |
| 2.3.1 Introduction | 25 |
| 2.3.2 Germany: Mistake of Law is an Excuse. | 26 |
| 2.3.2.1 Das Recht | 26 |
| 2.3.2.2 The Landmark Decision | 27 |
| 2.3.2.3 The Codification. | 33 |
| 2.3.2.4 The German Border Guard Cases | 40 |
| 2.3.2.4.1 The German Border Guard Cases: The Principle of Legality | 43 |
| 2.3.2.4.2 The German Border Guard Cases: Mistake of Law. | 44 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 2.3.2.5 | Conclusion | 47 |
| 2.3.3 | France: Mistake of Law is a Ground for Excluding Criminal Responsibility | 48 |
| 2.3.3.1 | The Provision | 50 |
| 2.3.3.2 | Avoidable Mistake | 51 |
| 2.3.3.3 | Conclusion | 53 |
| 2.4 | Superior Orders | 54 |
| 2.4.1 | USA and UK | 54 |
| 2.4.2 | Germany and France | 56 |
| 2.4.3 | Conclusion | 58 |
| 2.5 | Conclusion: Comparative Analysis | 58 |
| | References | 59 |
| 3 | Comparing the National Approaches: Theorising About the Issue | 63 |
| 3.1 | Introduction: Twofold and Threefold Structures | 63 |
| 3.2 | Relevant Distinctions | 64 |
| 3.2.1 | Justification and Excuse | 64 |
| 3.2.2 | Wrongdoing and Attribution | 67 |
| 3.2.3 | Defeasible and Comprehensive Rules | 68 |
| 3.2.4 | Conduct Rules and Decision Rules | 68 |
| 3.2.5 | Analysis | 70 |
| 3.3 | Other Issues | 71 |
| 3.3.1 | Criminal Intent | 71 |
| 3.3.2 | Putative Justifications | 72 |
| 3.3.3 | An Element of 'Unlawfulness' in the Crime Definition | 73 |
| 3.3.4 | The Principle of Legality | 75 |
| 3.4 | Conclusion | 76 |
| | References | 78 |
| 4 | The Theory of Mistake of Law in International Criminal Law | 81 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 81 |
| 4.2 | Article 32(2): Mistake of Law | 82 |
| 4.2.1 | Article 32 Mistake | 82 |
| 4.2.2 | Negate the Mental Element | 83 |
| 4.3 | Article 33: Superior Orders | 90 |
| 4.3.1 | Introduction | 90 |
| 4.3.2 | The Provision | 90 |
| 4.3.3 | Criticism: Departure from Customary International Law | 91 |
| 4.3.4 | Criticism: Manifest Illegality | 94 |
| 4.3.5 | Conclusion: Superior Orders a Separate Defence? | 95 |
| 4.4 | Concluding Analysis | 96 |
| | References | 98 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|-----|
| 5 | Applying the Theory of Mistake of Law: An Analysis of (Inter)national Case Law | 101 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 101 |
| 5.2 | The Case Law | 102 |
| 5.2.1 | Pre-WWII Case Law | 103 |
| 5.2.2 | WWII Case Law | 104 |
| 5.2.2.1 | United States | 104 |
| 5.2.2.2 | United Kingdom | 108 |
| 5.2.2.3 | Other Countries | 111 |
| 5.2.3 | Trials Related to Other Armed Conflicts After WWII | 118 |
| 5.2.4 | Recent Decisions | 122 |
| 5.2.4.1 | International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia | 122 |
| 5.2.4.2 | Special Court for Sierra Leone | 123 |
| 5.2.4.3 | International Criminal Court | 126 |
| 5.3 | Conclusion | 127 |
| | References | 129 |
| | | |
| 6 | Applying the Theory of Mistake of Law: An Analysis of Elements of Crimes and a Survey of Dilemmas on the Battlefield | 133 |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 133 |
| 6.2 | Subjective Requirements of Criminal Responsibility | 134 |
| 6.2.1 | Elements of Crimes | 134 |
| 6.2.1.1 | Elements of Crimes Against Humanity | 137 |
| 6.2.1.1.1 | Specific Elements: Deportation, Torture and Persecution | 137 |
| 6.2.1.2 | Elements of War Crimes | 138 |
| 6.2.1.2.1 | Specific Elements: Improper use of a flag, Insignia or Uniform | 141 |
| 6.2.1.3 | Conclusion | 143 |
| 6.3 | Dilemmas on the Battlefield | 144 |
| 6.3.1 | Mistakes About the Prohibition | 145 |
| 6.3.1.1 | Military Objectives | 146 |
| 6.3.2 | Putative Justifications | 151 |
| 6.3.2.1 | Mistake of Self-Defence | 151 |
| 6.3.2.2 | Necessity | 152 |
| 6.3.3 | Mistaken Defences Under Public International Law | 154 |
| 6.3.3.1 | Military Necessity | 154 |
| 6.3.3.2 | Reprisals | 157 |
| 6.4 | Conclusion | 161 |
| | References | 162 |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|-----|
| 7 Concluding Remarks | 167 |
| 7.1 Introduction | 167 |
| References | 169 |
| Bibliography | 171 |
| Table of Cases | 179 |