

# *Contents*

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>xvii</b>
<b>Preface to Third Edition</b>	<b>xxi</b>
<b>Preface to Second Edition</b>	<b>xxx</b>
<b>Preface to First Edition</b>	<b>xxxvii</b>

<b>1</b>	<b>Uncertainty in Forensic Science</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Statistics and the Law	3
1.3	Uncertainty in Scientific Evidence	11
	1.3.1 The Frequentist Method	15
	1.3.2 Stains of Body Fluids	17
	1.3.3 Glass Fragments	21
1.4	Terminology	29
1.5	Types of Data	34
1.6	Populations	36
1.7	Probability	41
	1.7.1 Introduction	41
	1.7.2 A Standard for Uncertainty	46
	1.7.3 Events	55
	1.7.4 Classical and Frequentist Definitions of Probability and Their Limitations	57
	1.7.5 Subjective Definition of Probability	60

**viii**      **Contents**

1.7.6	The Quantification of Probability Through a Betting Scheme	64
1.7.7	Probabilities and Frequencies: The Role of Exchangeability	69
1.7.8	Laws of Probability	78
1.7.9	Dependent Events and Background Information	82
1.7.10	Law of Total Probability	91
1.7.11	Updating of Probabilities	96

**2 The Evaluation of Evidence**      **101**

2.1	Odds	101
2.1.1	Complementary Events	101
2.1.2	Examples	104
2.1.3	Definition of Odds	105
2.2	Bayes' Theorem	108
2.2.1	Statement of the Theorem	109
2.2.2	Examples	109
2.3	The Odds Form of Bayes' Theorem	121
2.3.1	Likelihood Ratio	121
2.3.2	Bayes' Factor and Likelihood Ratio	125
2.3.3	Three-Way Tables	130
2.3.4	Logarithm of the Likelihood Ratio	134
2.4	The Value of Evidence	138
2.4.1	Evaluation of Forensic Evidence	138
2.4.2	Justification of the Use of the Likelihood Ratio	154
2.4.3	Single Value for the Likelihood Ratio	158
2.4.4	Role of Background Information	161
2.4.5	Summary of Competing Propositions	163
2.4.6	Qualitative Scale for the Value of the Evidence	168
2.5	Errors in Interpretation	180
2.5.1	Fallacy of the Transposed Conditional	186

**Contents**      **ix**

2.5.2	Source Probability Error	190
2.5.3	Ultimate Issue Error	194
2.5.4	Defence Attorney's Fallacy	194
2.5.5	Probability (Another Match) Error	196
2.5.6	Numerical Conversion Error	199
2.5.7	False Positive Fallacy	202
2.5.8	Expected Value Fallacy	203
2.5.9	Uniqueness	206
2.5.10	Other Difficulties	209
2.5.11	Empirical Evidence of Errors in Interpretation	220
2.6	Misinterpretations	233
2.7	Explanation of Transposed Conditional, Defence Attorney's and False Positive Fallacies	236
2.7.1	Explanation of the Fallacy of the Transposed Conditional	236
2.7.2	Explanation of the Defence Attorney's Fallacy	239
2.7.3	Explanation of the False Positive Fallacy	241
2.8	Making Coherent Decisions	245
2.8.1	Elements of Statistical Decision Theory	246
2.8.2	Decision Analysis: An Example	249
2.9	Graphical Probabilistic Models: Bayesian Networks	254
2.9.1	Elements of the Bayesian Networks	256
2.9.2	The Construction of Bayesian Networks	261
2.9.3	Bayesian Decision Networks (Influence Diagrams)	272
<b>3</b>	<b>Historical Review</b>	<b>279</b>
3.1	Early History	279
3.2	The Dreyfus Case	286

**x**      **Contents**

3.3	Statistical Arguments by Early Twentieth-Century Forensic Scientists	293
3.4	People v. Collins	299
3.5	Discriminating Power	307
3.5.1	Derivation	307
3.5.2	Evaluation of Evidence by Discriminating Power	310
3.5.3	Finite Samples	316
3.5.4	Combination of Independent Systems	319
3.5.5	Correlated Attributes	321
3.6	Significance Probabilities	325
3.6.1	Calculation of Significance Probabilities	326
3.6.2	Relationship to Likelihood Ratio	333
3.6.3	Combination of Significance Probabilities	338
3.7	Coincidence Probabilities	342
3.7.1	Introduction	342
3.7.2	Comparison Stage	346
3.7.3	Significance Stage	347
3.8	Likelihood Ratio	351

**4 Bayesian Inference**      **359**

4.1	Introduction	359
4.2	Inference for a Proportion	368
4.2.1	Interval Estimation	374
4.2.2	Estimation with Zero Occurrences in a Sample	381
4.2.3	Uncertainty on Sensitivity and Specificity	387
4.3	Sampling	392
4.3.1	Choice of Sample Size in Large Consignments	398
4.3.2	Choice of Sample Size in Small Consignments	413
4.4	Bayesian Networks for Sampling Inspection	420

**Contents**      **xi**

4.4.1	Large Consignments	420
4.4.2	Small Consignments	425
4.5	Inference for a Normal Mean	429
4.5.1	Known Variance	431
4.5.2	Unknown Variance	438
4.5.3	Interval Estimation	445
4.6	Quantity Estimation	449
4.6.1	Predictive Approach in Small Consignments	452
4.6.2	Predictive Approach in Large Consignments	461
4.7	Decision Analysis	464
4.7.1	Standard Loss Functions	465
4.7.2	Decision Analysis for Forensic Sampling	471

**5 Evidence and Propositions:  
Theory**      **483**

5.1	The Choice of Propositions and Pre-Assessment	483
5.2	Levels of Propositions and Roles of the Forensic Scientist	485
5.3	The Formal Development of a Likelihood Ratio for Different Propositions and Discrete Characteristics	499
5.3.1	Likelihood Ratio with Source Level Propositions	499
5.3.2	Likelihood Ratio with Activity Level Propositions	519
5.3.3	Likelihood Ratio with Offence Level Propositions	553
5.4	Validation of Bayesian Network Structures: An Example	562
5.5	Pre-Assessment	568
5.5.1	Pre-assessment of the Case	568
5.5.2	Pre-assessment of Evidence	575

**xii**      **Contents**

5.5.3	Pre-assessment: A Practical Example	576
5.6	Combination of Items of Evidence	592
5.6.1	A Difficulty in Combining Evidence: The Problem of Conjunction	594
5.6.2	Generic Patterns of Inference in Combining Evidence	598

**6 Evidence and Propositions: Practice**      **615**

6.1	Examples for Evaluation given Source Level Propositions	615
6.1.1	General Population	616
6.1.2	Particular Population	617
6.1.3	A Note on The Appropriate Databases for Evaluation Given Source Level Propositions	619
6.1.4	Two Trace Problem	627
6.1.5	Many Samples	633
6.1.6	Multiple Propositions	637
6.1.7	A Note on Biological Traces	654
6.1.8	Additional Considerations on Source Level Propositions	670
6.2	Examples for Evaluation given Activity Level Propositions	699
6.2.1	A Practical Approach to Fibres Evaluation	701
6.2.2	A Practical Approach to Glass Evaluation	704
6.2.3	The Assignment of Probabilities for Transfer Events	713
6.2.4	The Assignment of Probabilities for Background Traces	734
6.2.5	Presence of Material with Non-corresponding Features	739
6.2.6	Absence of Evidence for Activity Level Propositions	741

6.3	Examples for Evaluation given Offence Level Propositions	745
6.3.1	One Stain, $k$ Offenders	745
6.3.2	Two Stains, One Offender	752
6.3.3	Paternity and The Combination of Likelihood Ratios	756
6.3.4	Probability of Paternity	762
6.3.5	Absence of Evidence for Offence Level Propositions	768
6.3.6	A Note on Relevance and Offence Level Propositions	773
6.4	Summary	774
6.4.1	Stain Known to Have Been Left by Offenders: Source-Level Propositions	774
6.4.2	Material Known to Have Been (or Not to Have Been) Left by Offenders: Activity-Level Propositions	777
6.4.3	Stain May Not Have Been Left by Offenders: Offence-Level Propositions	779
<b>7</b>	<b>Data Analysis</b>	<b>783</b>
7.1	Introduction	783
7.2	Theory for Discrete Data	785
7.2.1	Data of Independent Counts with a Poisson Distribution	787
7.2.2	Data of Independent Counts with a Binomial Distribution	791
7.2.3	Data of Independent Counts with a Multinomial Distribution	793
7.3	Theory for Continuous Univariate Data	798
7.3.1	Assessment of Similarity Only	802
7.3.2	Sources of Variation: Two-Level Models	808
7.3.3	Transfer Probability	810
7.4	Normal Between-Source Variation	814

**xiv**      **Contents**

7.4.1	Marginal Distribution of Measurements	814
7.4.2	Approximate Derivation of the Likelihood Ratio	817
7.4.3	Lindley's Approach	820
7.4.4	Interpretation of Result	825
7.4.5	Examples	827
7.5	Non-normal Between-Source Variation	830
7.5.1	Estimation of a Probability Density Function	831
7.5.2	Kernel Density Estimation for Between-Source Data	842
7.5.3	Examples	844
7.6	Multivariate Analysis	849
7.6.1	Introduction	849
7.6.2	Multivariate Two-Level Models	851
7.6.3	A Note on Sensitivity	864
7.6.4	Case Study for Two-Level Data	865
7.6.5	Three-Level Models	876
7.7	Discrimination	882
7.7.1	Discrete Data	884
7.7.2	Continuous Data	889
7.7.3	Autocorrelated Data	893
7.7.4	Multivariate Data	894
7.7.5	Cut-Offs and Legal Thresholds	899
7.8	Score-Based Models	906
7.8.1	Example	910
7.9	Bayes' Factor and Likelihood Ratio (cont.)	913

**8 Assessment of the Performance of Methods for the Evaluation of Evidence**      **919**

8.1	Introduction	919
8.2	Properties of Methods for Evaluation	928
8.3	General Topics Relating to Sample Size Estimation and to Assessment	933



**Contents**      **xv**

8.3.1	Probability of Strong Misleading Evidence: A Sample Size Problem	933
8.3.2	Calibration	948
8.4	Assessment of Performance of a Procedure for the Calculation of the Likelihood Ratio	952
8.4.1	Histograms and Tippett Plots	956
8.4.2	False Positive Rates, False Negative Rates and DET Plots	959
8.4.3	Empirical Cross-Entropy	961
8.5	Case Study: Kinship Analysis	972
8.6	Conclusion	979

**Appendix A Probability Distributions**      **981**

A.1	Introduction	981
A.2	Probability Distributions for Counts	988
A.2.1	Probabilities	988
A.2.2	Summary Measures	990
A.2.3	Binomial Distribution	995
A.2.4	Multinomial Distribution	997
A.2.5	Hypergeometric Distribution	998
A.2.6	Poisson Distribution	1000
A.2.7	Beta-Binomial and Dirichlet-Multinomial Distributions	1002
A.3	Measurements	1005
A.3.1	Summary Statistics	1005
A.3.2	Normal Distribution	1007
A.3.3	Jeffreys' Prior Distributions	1021
A.3.4	Student's <i>t</i> -Distribution	1021
A.3.5	Gamma and Chi-Squared Distributions	1025
A.3.6	Inverse Gamma and Inverse Chi-Squared Distributions	1026
A.3.7	Beta Distribution	1028
A.3.8	Dirichlet Distribution	1032
A.3.9	Multivariate Normal Distribution and Correlation	1035

**xvi**      **Contents**

A.3.10	Wishart Distribution	1040
A.3.11	Inverse Wishart Distribution	1041

**Appendix B Matrix Properties**      **1043**

B.1	Matrix Terminology	1043
B.1.1	The Trace of a Square Matrix	1044
B.1.2	The Transpose of a Matrix	1044
B.1.3	Addition of Two Matrices	1045
B.1.4	Determinant of a Matrix	1045
B.1.5	Matrix Multiplication	1046
B.1.6	The Inverse of a Matrix	1048
B.1.7	Completion of the Square	1049

**References**      **1051**

**Notation**      **1143**

**Cases**      **1157**

**Author Index**      **1163**

**Subject Index**      **1187**