

# CONTENTS

---

Preface [xi](#)

Table of Treaties and Cases [xiii](#)

## **PART I: General Concepts**

1. An Introduction to Proportionality [3](#)
  - A. General Concepts [3](#)
  - B. Legal Sources [8](#)
  - C. The Structure of the Book [9](#)
  
2. Ethical and Constitutional Foundations [11](#)
  - A. The Possible Sources for Proportionality [11](#)
  - B. A Philosophical and Religious Prism of Proportionality [12](#)
    - Premodern Views of Proportionality [12](#)
    - The Philosophical Background [14](#)
  - C. The Rational Analysis of Proportionality [16](#)
    - Rational Reciprocal Explanation [16](#)
  - D. Proportionality as a Mode of Control [18](#)
  - E. The Constitutional and Administrative Background to Proportionality Analysis [21](#)
  
3. A General Overview of Proportionality in IHL [23](#)
  - A. The History and Development of IHL Proportionality [23](#)
  - B. Contemporary IHL and Proportionality [29](#)
  - C. The Changing Nature of Armed Conflict and Proportionality [33](#)
    - Applying Proportionality: Examples and Dilemmas [35](#)
    - Fighting Non-State Actors and the Application of the Principle of Proportionality [39](#)
    - Parallel Application of IHL and International Human Rights Law [44](#)
    - The Right to Life during Armed Conflicts [48](#)
    - Different Balances of IHL/HRL in Different Types of Armed Conflicts? [50](#)
  - D. Conclusion [55](#)

## **PART II: The Practical Application of Proportionality**

4. Military Advantage [59](#)
  - A. What Constitutes a Military Advantage? [60](#)
  - B. Military Advantage of an Attack [65](#)

5. Incidental Harm and the Analysis of Proportionality 73
  - A. Civilians or All Persons Protected from Attack 73
  - B. What Constitutes Harm? 78
    - Harm to the Person 78
    - Economic Damage 80
    - Civilian Objects 81
    - Damage to the Natural Environment 81
    - Benefitting from Proportional Harm 83
  - C. Indirect and Reverberating Effects 83
    - Foreseeable Harm 84
    - Causality 87
  - D. Level of Expectation/Anticipation 88
  - E. A Balancing Act: What Constitutes a Violation? 92
    - Different Standards in Different Conflicts? 99
    - Excessive vs. Extensive: An Upper Limit to Civilian Harm? 100
  - F. From Whose Perspective Should Proportionality Be Examined? 101
  
6. Soldiers vs. Civilians 107
  - A. The Basic Dilemma 107
  - B. The Kasher vs. Walzer Debate 108
  - C. The Lives of Soldiers and Proportionality 110
  - D. The Context of Force Protection 114
  - E. The Enemy's Soldiers 117
  
7. Strategic and Cultural Considerations 119
  - A. The Meaning of "Concrete and Direct Military Advantage" 120
  - B. Policy Arguments Regarding Strategic and Cultural Considerations 121
    - The Divide between IHL and Laws on the Use of Force 121
    - An Inherent or Tangible Military Advantage? 122
    - Uncertainty and Manipulations 123
  - C. Who Bears the Burden of Accommodating a State's Sensitivities? 125
    - A Matter of Context? 126
    - Permitting Less Collateral Damage? 127
  - D. Different Requirements for Different States? 128
  - E. The Futility of Force, Deterrence, and Proportionality 131
  
8. Direct Participation in Hostilities and Its Effect on Proportionality 135
  - A. The Concept of Direct Participation in Hostilities 135
  - B. The Definition of Direct Participation in Hostilities 139
  
9. Human Shields and Proportionality 145
  - A. The Problem of Human Shields 145
  - B. Involuntary Human Shields 147

- C. Voluntary Human Shields 149
  - D. Discerning Choice 150
10. The Principle of Distinction and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
- A. The Definition of Military Objectives and Its Relation to Proportionality 155
  - B. Indiscriminate Attacks 159
    - Protection of Cultural Property 165

### **PART III: Understanding Proportionality**

11. The Vagueness of Proportionality 169
- A. Experimental Meanings of Proportionality 169
  - B. The Formula of Proportionality 171
  - C. Rules of Thumb 174
  - D. Inherent Vagueness? 175
12. Procedural Aspects of Proportionality 177
- A. The Legal Background 178
  - B. Procedures 179
  - C. The Suitable Decision-Maker 181
    - Doubts 187
  - D. How Much Intelligence Is Necessary? 189
  - E. Warnings 194
    - Roof Knocking 196
  - F. What Is the Role of Military Legal Advisors? 197
  - G. Conclusion 199
    - Creating a Zone of Reasonableness 199
    - Responsibility and Control 199
    - Organization and Culture 200
13. Judicial Review and Investigations 201
- A. Introduction 201
  - B. *Ex Ante* Review 201
  - C. *Ex Post* Review: The Problem with the Criminal Approach 203
    - Criminal Investigations 204
    - The Problem with Criminal Investigations 205
    - Should Criminal Prosecutions Be Forsaken? 212
  - D. *Ex Post* Assessment: An Alternative to Criminal Trials 214
    - The Non-Exclusive Nature of the Grave Breaches Regime under IHL 215
  - E. The Saleh Shehadeh Targeted Killing 220

14. The Future of Proportionality	223
A. On the Future of Proportionality	224
Image-Fare	224
Cyber Warfare and Proportionality	225
Autonomous Weapons and Proportionality	226
 Conclusion—A Way Forward?	231
 Bibliography	233
Index	247