

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
	A. Background of the Research and Subject Matter . . . . .	1
	B. Research Questions and Roadmap . . . . .	6
	C. On the Sources of Law Used and the Approach Taken . . . . .	8
 <b>Part I Analytical Scope and International Legal Framework</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Basic Terms and Concepts</b> . . . . .	13
	A. International Definitions of ‘Gender-Based Violence’ and ‘Sexual(ized) Violence’ . . . . .	14
	I. Violence Against Women as ‘Gender-Based Violence’ . . . . .	14
	1. International Definitions . . . . .	15
	2. Scenarios of Violence Against Women . . . . .	15
	II. Non-conflict and Conflict-Related Sexual(ized) Violence Against Women and Men . . . . .	16
	1. Sexualized Violence Under the WHO . . . . .	17
	2. Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence . . . . .	17
	III. Conclusion: Gender-Based and Sexualized Violence . . . . .	19
	B. Causes of Violence Against Women . . . . .	19
	I. Individual Reasons . . . . .	20
	II. Political Goals in Conflict Settings . . . . .	20
	III. Societal Factors . . . . .	21
	IV. Hierarchies–Gender Stereotypes–Discrimination–Violence: A Continuum . . . . .	22
	1. Gender Injustice in a Nutshell: The Iceberg-Model Through a Life Course Perspective . . . . .	23
	2. Ground-Level of the Iceberg: Hierarchization and Stereotypes . . . . .	24
	3. Second Layer of the Iceberg: Discrimination in All Fields of Life . . . . .	26

a. Childhood . . . . .	26
b. Adolescence and Youth . . . . .	28
c. Adulthood . . . . .	30
d. Senior Years +65 . . . . .	32
4. Third Layer and Tip of the Iceberg: Gender-Based Violence . . . . .	33
V. Conclusion: Need for a Transformative Approach to Violence Against Women . . . . .	33
C. Violence Against Women as Discrimination: International Legal Approaches and Their Shortcomings . . . . .	35
I. Concepts of Discrimination and Equality . . . . .	36
1. Concepts of Discrimination . . . . .	36
a. Legal Concepts: Direct and Indirect Discrimination . . . . .	36
b. Structural Discrimination: Contextualized Perspective for Effective Anti-discrimination Policies . . . . .	37
2. Concepts of Equality . . . . .	39
a. Legal Concepts: Formal and Substantive Equality . . . . .	39
b. Transformative Equality: Adding a Forward Looking Element . . . . .	40
II. Approaches to Equality and Non-discrimination Under CEDAW . . . . .	41
1. Definition of Discrimination Under Article 1 CEDAW . . . . .	41
2. Authoritative Interpretation of Article 1: General Recommendation No. 25 . . . . .	42
III. Conclusion . . . . .	43
<b>3 The Legal Frameworks Applicable to Violence Against Women . . . . .</b>	<b>45</b>
A. Humanitarian Rules Applicable in Armed Conflicts: Addressing the Tip of the Iceberg . . . . .	46
I. Early Developments . . . . .	46
II. Today's Humanitarian Rules . . . . .	47
1. Protection During International Armed Conflicts . . . . .	47
a. The Geneva Convention IV . . . . .	48
1) Articles 27 and 32 GC IV . . . . .	48
2) Positive Obligations Under the Grave Breaches Regime . . . . .	49
3) Scope of Application . . . . .	51
b. The Prisoner of War Convention (POW/GC III) of 1949 . . . . .	52
c. Extending the Group of Protected Persons: Additional Protocol I of 1977 . . . . .	52
1) Articles 75 AP I . . . . .	52
2) Articles 76 AP I . . . . .	54
3) No Supplementary Protection Under the Grave Breaches Regime . . . . .	54

2. Protection During Non-international Armed Conflicts . . . . .	55
a. Treaty Law . . . . .	55
b. Customary Law . . . . .	56
III. Conclusion . . . . .	57
B. Human Rights Treaties Applicable in Peacetime and Armed Conflicts . . . . .	57
I. Applicability of Human Rights Treaties . . . . .	57
1. Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Obligations . . . . .	57
a. Territorial or Personal Control as a Precondition for Extraterritorial Application . . . . .	58
b. Extraterritorial Application of Positive Obligations . . . . .	59
c. Positive Obligations Having an Extraterritorial Effect . . . . .	59
d. Conclusion: Extraterritorial Application and Effects of Positive Obligations . . . . .	61
2. Personal Scope of Application or Attribution . . . . .	61
3. Particular Problems with Regard to Gender-Based Violence in Wartime: Temporal and Material Scope of Application . . . . .	64
a. Temporal Restriction or Permanent Applicability . . . . .	65
b. Material Scope: Normative Conflicts . . . . .	67
1) Coexisting Norms: Applying HRL and IHL During Armed Conflicts . . . . .	67
2) The Relationship Between IHL and IHR Provisions Protecting Against Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence . . . . .	70
c. Conclusion . . . . .	73
II. Human Rights (Instruments) Protecting Against Gender-Based Violence . . . . .	74
1. Specific Instruments and Conventions Explicitly Addressing Violence Against Women . . . . .	74
a. Universal Instruments and Soft Law Documents . . . . .	74
1) CEDAW . . . . .	74
2) Soft Law Instruments . . . . .	75
b. Regional Human Rights Instruments . . . . .	79
1) Organization of American States: 1994 Belém do Pará Convention . . . . .	79
2) African Union: 2003 Maputo Protocol and Subsequent Instruments . . . . .	81
3) Council of Europe: 2011 Istanbul Convention . . . . .	82
2. General Treaties Guaranteeing Rights That Are Impaired or Nullified by Gender-Based Violence . . . . .	85
a. Rights of Freedom Potentially Violated When Gender-Based Violence Occurs . . . . .	85
b. Rights to Non-discrimination . . . . .	86
C. Conclusion: Legal Framework Applicable to Violence Against Women . . . . .	88

<b>Part II State Responsibility for Violence Against Women: Transformative Potential of Primary and Secondary Human Rights Obligations</b>	
<b>4 Primary Obligations: Positive Human Rights Obligations in Context . . . . .</b>	<b>93</b>
A. Normative Basis . . . . .	94
I. Thematic Human Rights Treaties . . . . .	95
II. General Human Rights Treaties . . . . .	96
1. ACHR . . . . .	96
2. ECHR . . . . .	97
3. ICCPR . . . . .	98
B. Nature and Content of Positive Obligations . . . . .	99
I. Measures Potentially Complying with Positive Obligations and the Right to an Effective Remedy . . . . .	99
II. Different Kinds of Positive Obligations . . . . .	102
1. Positive Obligations as Regards Third Actors: Obligation to Protect . . . . .	102
2. Positive Obligations as Regards the State Itself . . . . .	103
3. Obligation to Fulfill Human Rights . . . . .	103
4. Violence Against Women and the ‘Due Diligence Standard’ . . . . .	104
C. Conclusion: Basic Assumption and Terminology . . . . .	105
<b>5 Parameters to Establish the Existence and Extent of Positive Obligations . . . . .</b>	<b>107</b>
A. Parameters to Establish Whether Protective and Preventive Duties Apply . . . . .	109
I. Danger of Harm and Knowledge About It . . . . .	109
1. Level of Danger Required for Positive Obligations to Arise in a Particular Case . . . . .	110
2. Level of Danger Required for Obligations to Provide for a Legal and Administrative Framework . . . . .	112
II. State Capacity to Influence Effectively the Situation Impairing the Exercise of Human Rights . . . . .	113
1. De jure Relationship with the Abuser . . . . .	114
2. De facto Relationship with the Circumstances, the Abuser or the Victim . . . . .	114
a. ‘Supervisor Guarantor’ Position . . . . .	115
b. ‘Protector Guarantor’ . . . . .	116
III. Severity of Harm and ‘Vulnerability of Victims’ Group’ . . . . .	117
1. Severity of Harm . . . . .	118
2. Vulnerability as a Distinct Reason for Protection: A Critical Evaluation . . . . .	119
a. Philosophical Concepts of Vulnerability . . . . .	120
b. Severity of Harm as Unifying Criterion . . . . .	121
c. Conclusion: Irrelevance of the ‘Vulnerability’ Criterion . . . . .	123

IV. Conclusion . . . . .	123
1. Parameters to Establish the Existence of Positive Obligations of Protection and Prevention . . . . .	123
2. Parameters Applied to Violence Against Women . . . . .	124
B. Scope of and Limits to Positive Obligations . . . . .	126
I. Scope of Positive Obligations . . . . .	126
1. Concept of ‘Due Diligence’ Under General International Law . . . . .	128
2. Standard Applied by International Courts and (Quasi-)Judicial Bodies . . . . .	128
a. IACtHR . . . . .	129
b. ECtHR . . . . .	129
c. CEDAW Committee . . . . .	131
d. ICJ . . . . .	131
3. Conclusion . . . . .	132
II. Factors Informing and Limits to a State’s Discretion . . . . .	133
1. Factors That Inform a State’s Discretion . . . . .	134
a. Rights of Others . . . . .	134
b. Interests of a State and the Community . . . . .	135
c. Relationship of a State with the Abuser/Situation . . . . .	135
d. Scale and Intensity of Harm . . . . .	135
e. Compatibility of Measures with Other Obligations Under International Law . . . . .	137
f. Financial Restrictions . . . . .	137
2. Limits to a State’s Discretion: Fair-Balance Test . . . . .	138
III. Conclusion . . . . .	139
C. Factors Potentially Required to Establish a Violation of Preventive and Protective Obligations . . . . .	140
I. Occurrence of the Event Which the State Was Required to Prevent . . . . .	140
II. Relevance of Causality Between the Impairment of Rights and a State’s Omission . . . . .	141
III. Conclusion . . . . .	143
<b>6 Measures Against Gender-Based Violence . . . . .</b>	<b>145</b>
A. Measures Against Gender-Based Violence as Foreseen Under CEDAW, the Istanbul and the Belém do Pará Conventions . . . . .	146
I. Short-Term Measures: Directly Addressing Gender-Based Violence . . . . .	146
1. State Level . . . . .	146
a. Legislative Measures: Substantive and Procedural Provisions . . . . .	147
1) Procedural Provisions . . . . .	147
2) Substantive Provisions . . . . .	148
3) Reparation Measures and Remedies . . . . .	149

b. Administrative and Judicial Measures . . . . .	154
1) Gender-Sensitive Investigation, Prosecution, Punishment . . . . .	154
2) Support Services for (Potential) Victims . . . . .	155
2. Addressing the Public . . . . .	156
3. Addressing the Individual . . . . .	156
4. Interstate Cooperation . . . . .	157
5. Conclusion . . . . .	157
II. Long-Term Prevention: Towards Transformation . . . . .	158
1. Combating <i>de jure</i> and <i>de facto</i> Discrimination Against Women by Public and Private Actors . . . . .	159
2. Improving the Position of Women by Special Measures . . . . .	161
3. Addressing Harmful Gender Stereotypes and Hierarchies . . . . .	162
4. Conclusion: Towards Transformation . . . . .	164
III. Conclusion . . . . .	164
B. Content of Positive Obligations Under Customary International Law . . . . .	165
<b>7 Secondary Obligations: Individual Reparation and Beyond . . . . .</b>	<b>169</b>
A. Notion of Reparation . . . . .	171
I. Notion of ‘Reparation’ in Human Rights Law . . . . .	171
II. International Plea for Transformative Reparation . . . . .	172
B. Status of Victim . . . . .	175
I. Definition of Victim in International Soft Law . . . . .	176
II. Regional Concepts of Victim . . . . .	177
1. Concept of Victim According to the ECtHR . . . . .	177
a. Direct and Indirect Victims . . . . .	177
1) Heirs as Indirect Victims . . . . .	179
2) Close Family Members as Victims in Their Own Rights . . . . .	179
b. Harm, Causality and Standard of Proof . . . . .	180
2. Concept of Victim According to the IACtHR . . . . .	181
a. Direct and Indirect Victims Before the IACtHR . . . . .	182
b. Harm, Causality and Standard of Proof . . . . .	184
3. Conclusion . . . . .	185
a. Direct and Indirect Victims . . . . .	185
b. Approaches Taken Regarding Harm, Causality and Standard of Proof . . . . .	186
C. Practice of the IACtHR and the ECtHR: Individual Reparation and Beyond . . . . .	186
I. Practice of the IACtHR Under Article 63 (1) ACHR . . . . .	187
1. A Broad Definition of Reparation . . . . .	187
2. Transformative Potential of Non-monetary Measures Ordered in Gender-Based Violence Cases . . . . .	188

a. Satisfaction: Recognizing the Wrong Done by Gender-Based Violence . . . . .	188
b. Guarantees of Non-repetition . . . . .	189
II. Practice Within the European Human Rights System: Individual Compensation and Beyond . . . . .	192
1. Limited Competence Under Article 41 ECHR . . . . .	192
2. The Practice Under Article 46 ECHR . . . . .	193
a. Supervision of the Execution and Implementation of Judgments by the Committee of Ministers . . . . .	194
b. Practice of the Court to Indicate Measures and to Initiate Pilot Judgment Procedures . . . . .	196
III. Comparing the Approaches of the IACtHR and the ECtHR . . . . .	197
1. Differences Regarding Their Theoretical and Procedural Approaches . . . . .	197
2. Content of Guarantees of Non-repetition . . . . .	199
3. Transformative Potential on Structurally Discriminatory Settings . . . . .	200
D. Conclusion . . . . .	201
<b>8 Findings . . . . .</b>	<b>203</b>
A. Thematic Human Rights Conventions Address Violence Against Women and Structural Discrimination . . . . .	204
B. Addressing Structural Discrimination Under General Human Rights Treaties . . . . .	205
I. Primary Obligations . . . . .	206
1. Conditions for Positive Obligations of Protection and Prevention to Apply . . . . .	206
2. Scope of Positive Obligations . . . . .	207
3. Factors Impeding the Finding of a Violation of Positive Obligations . . . . .	207
II. Secondary Obligations and Beyond: An Individual Complaint Concerning Gender-Based Violence Brought Before the ECtHR or the IACtHR Can Have a Systemic and Partly Transformative Impact . . . . .	208
1. Legal Framework and Practice . . . . .	208
2. Comparing the Transformative Potential of Guarantees of Non-Repetition . . . . .	209
3. Transformative Reparation: A Theoretically Flawed Concept . . . . .	209
<b>A. Table of Cases, Documents and Reports . . . . .</b>	<b>211</b>
I. International and Regional Jurisprudence . . . . .	211
1. International Jurisprudence . . . . .	211
2. Regional Jurisprudence . . . . .	213

II. International and Regional Documents . . . . .	217
1. International Documents . . . . .	217
2. Regional Documents . . . . .	223
3. Other Documents and Reports . . . . .	224
<b>Bibliography . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>