

## CONTENTS

|                                     |         |
|-------------------------------------|---------|
| <i>List of figures and tables</i>   | page xv |
| <i>Preface and acknowledgements</i> | xvii    |
| <i>Table of GATT 1947 Reports</i>   | xix     |
| <i>Table of WTO Reports</i>         | xxi     |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i>        | xxvi    |

|              |   |
|--------------|---|
| Introduction | 1 |
|--------------|---|

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <b>I Foundations: the relevance of NPA measures at the interface of domestic regulation, economic globalization and world trade law</b> | <b>7</b> |
| 1 Setting the stage for legal analysis  | 11       |
| 1.1 Brief introduction to the topic   | 11       |
| 1.2 The crucial cases   | 13       |
| 1.2.1 <i>Tuna-Dolphin I</i> (1991)  | 13       |
| 1.2.2 <i>Tuna-Dolphin II</i> (1994)   | 15       |
| 1.2.3 <i>Shrimp Turtle</i> (1998)   | 16       |
| 1.2.3.1 The Panel Report  | 17       |
| 1.2.3.2 The Appellate Body Report   | 18       |
| 1.2.3.3 <i>Shrimp Turtle – Article 21.5</i> (2001)  | 20       |
| 1.3 Overview of the PPM debate  | 20       |
| 1.3.1 Emergence of the PPM debate   | 21       |
| 1.3.2 Developments in academia and practice   | 22       |
| 1.3.3 Concepts and terms central to the ‘PPM debate’  | 25       |
| 1.3.3.1 The product–process distinction   | 25       |
| 1.3.3.2 Processes and production methods  | 27       |
| 1.3.3.3 ‘Product-related’ and ‘non-product-related’ PPMs  | 28       |
| 1.3.4 Unanswered questions and legal uncertainty  | 29       |
| 1.4 Identification of key legal issues  | 31       |
| 1.4.1 Customs tariffs   | 32       |
| 1.4.1.1 Article II  | 32       |
| 1.4.1.2 The relevance of international rules  | 33       |
| 1.4.1.3 Obligation to most-favoured-nation treatment  | 35       |
| 1.4.2 Import prohibitions or other quantitative restrictions  | 36       |

|           |  |    |
|-----------|--|----|
| 1.4.3     | Non-tax internal regulation  | 38 |
| 1.4.4     | Internal taxes and other internal charges  | 39 |
| 1.4.4.1   | Indirect taxation and NPAs   | 40 |
| 1.4.4.2   | Direct taxes and NPAs  | 43 |
| 1.4.5     | Border tax adjustment  | 43 |
| 1.4.5.1   | Imports  | 44 |
| 1.4.5.2   | Exports  | 45 |
| 1.4.6     | Anti-dumping duties  | 46 |
| 1.4.7     | Subsidies  | 48 |
| 1.4.7.1   | Subsidies linked to NPAs   | 48 |
| 1.4.7.2   | Low standards as illegitimate subsidization  | 51 |
| 1.4.8     | General exceptions   | 52 |
| 1.4.8.1   | The particular exceptions  | 53 |
| 1.4.8.2   | The introductory provision of Article XX   | 54 |
| 1.4.9     | Technical barriers to trade and sanitary and phytosanitary measures                              | 55 |
| 1.4.10    | Summary  | 56 |
| 1.5       | Delineation and foundations of the legal analysis  | 57 |
| 1.5.1     | Scope of the analysis  | 57 |
| 1.5.1.1   | General object of research: trade in goods   | 57 |
| 1.5.1.2   | Scope of the legal analysis  | 60 |
| 1.5.2     | Terms and concepts   | 61 |
| 1.5.2.1   | NPA measures   | 61 |
| 1.5.2.2   | Processes and production methods or 'PPMs'   | 62 |
| 2         | Putting the debate into perspective: analysis of the socio-economic context                      | 64 |
| 2.1       | National regulation and NPAs   | 65 |
| 2.1.1     | Overview of regulation   | 66 |
| 2.1.1.1   | General domestic regulation  | 66 |
| 2.1.1.2   | The notion of social regulation  | 68 |
| 2.1.1.3   | Different modes of regulation  | 70 |
| 2.1.2     | Differences and similarities in regulatory cultures: the example of the United States and Europe | 74 |
| 2.1.2.1   | Regulation in the United States  | 75 |
| 2.1.2.2   | Regulation in Western Europe   | 78 |
| 2.1.2.3   | Assessment of differences and similarities   | 81 |
| 2.1.3     | The economic case for state intervention   | 83 |
| 2.1.3.1   | Basic considerations on free markets and the economic role of governments                        | 84 |
| 2.1.3.2   | Categories of economic rationales for regulation   | 86 |
| 2.1.3.2.1 | Regulation to safeguard competitive markets  | 87 |
| 2.1.3.2.2 | Regulation addressing market failure   | 88 |
| 2.1.3.2.3 | Regulation in pursuit of distributional or social objectives                                     | 90 |
| 2.1.3.3   | Preliminary conclusion   | 91 |

|           |  |            |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 2.2       | International trade and NPA measures   | 92         |
| 2.2.1     | Design parameters of the multilateral trading system   | 92         |
| 2.2.1.1   | Object and purpose of the WTO Agreements   | 92         |
| 2.2.1.1.1 | Identification   | 93         |
| 2.2.1.1.2 | Relevance  | 96         |
| 2.2.1.2   | Economic rationales of the multilateral trading system   | 98         |
| 2.2.2     | The interface of domestic regulation and international trade                                     | 100        |
| 2.2.2.1   | The general debate on domestic regulation  | 100        |
| 2.2.2.2   | NPA measures and international trade in goods  | 103        |
| 2.2.3     | Political arguments in the international debate  | 104        |
| 2.2.3.1   | Effective and efficient protection of national or foreign objects                                | 104        |
| 2.2.3.2   | Sovereignty and extraterritoriality  | 106        |
| 2.2.3.3   | Unilateralism  | 108        |
| 2.2.3.4   | Competitiveness and effective regulation   | 110        |
| 2.2.3.5   | Summary  | 113        |
| <b>II</b> | <b>Legal analysis: reviewing the status of NPA measures <i>de lege lata</i></b>                  | <b>115</b> |
| 3         | Preliminary considerations: applicability of WTO law and other international law to NPA measures | 119        |
| 3.1       | Applicability of WTO law to NPA measures   | 120        |
| 3.2       | The relevance of conventional international law in WTO dispute settlement                        | 121        |
| 3.2.1     | No closed self-contained regime  | 122        |
| 3.2.2     | General applicability of international law   | 124        |
| 3.2.3     | Conflicts with other international treaties and instruments                                      | 128        |
| 3.2.3.1   | Existence of a conflict of norms   | 128        |
| 3.2.3.2   | Applicable conflict rules  | 132        |
| 3.2.3.2.1 | Asymmetrical conflicts   | 133        |
| 3.2.3.2.2 | Symmetrical conflicts  | 134        |
| 3.2.3.3   | Conflicts of norms, NPAs and the example of CITES  | 138        |
| 3.3       | NPA measures and the law on state responsibility   | 140        |
| 3.4       | Conclusion   | 145        |
| 4         | Consistency with GATT obligations  | 147        |
| 4.1       | The scope of the national treatment obligations  | 149        |
| 4.1.1     | The use of specific terms  | 150        |
| 4.1.1.1   | Narrow interpretation: products  | 151        |
| 4.1.1.2   | Broad interpretation: 'affecting'  | 152        |
| 4.1.1.3   | Preliminary conclusion   | 155        |
| 4.1.2     | Comparison of Article III:2 and 4  | 156        |
| 4.1.3     | Measures 'of the same nature'  | 158        |
| 4.1.4     | Summary and conclusion   | 161        |

|             |   |     |
|-------------|---|-----|
| 4.2         | The principle of non-discrimination and the 'like products' concept         | 162 |
| 4.2.1       | Introduction to the principle of non-discrimination                         | 162 |
| 4.2.1.1     | General problems inherent to the principle                                  | 163 |
| 4.2.1.2     | Clear prohibition of origin-based discrimination                            | 165 |
| 4.2.1.3     | Non-discrimination and NPAs   | 167 |
| 4.2.2       | Interpreting the 'like products' concept with special consideration of NPAs | 168 |
| 4.2.2.1     | The DSB approach: 'objective' determination                                 | 169 |
| 4.2.2.1.1   | Main features   | 170 |
| 4.2.2.1.1.1 | Relevant factors  | 172 |
| 4.2.2.1.1.2 | Varying importance of factors   | 174 |
| 4.2.2.1.1.3 | Degree of 'likeness' under different provisions                             | 177 |
| 4.2.2.1.2   | Relevance of NPAs   | 179 |
| 4.2.2.1.2.1 | Processes and production methods  | 179 |
| 4.2.2.1.2.2 | Output and producer characteristics   | 183 |
| 4.2.2.1.2.3 | Price   | 189 |
| 4.2.2.1.2.4 | National policies and regulatory regimes                                    | 192 |
| 4.2.2.1.3   | Relevance of 'minor' physical differences                                   | 196 |
| 4.2.2.1.3.1 | Editorial content   | 197 |
| 4.2.2.1.3.2 | Environmental impacts   | 200 |
| 4.2.2.1.3.3 | Toxicity and risk   | 201 |
| 4.2.2.1.3.4 | Genetic modifications   | 203 |
| 4.2.2.1.4   | Summary   | 204 |
| 4.2.2.2     | The 'aim and effects' theory  | 206 |
| 4.2.2.2.1   | Rationales and main elements  | 207 |
| 4.2.2.2.1.1 | The criteria  | 208 |
| 4.2.2.2.1.2 | Scope and relevance   | 209 |
| 4.2.2.2.1.3 | Diversity of opinions   | 210 |
| 4.2.2.2.2   | Significance for NPA measures   | 211 |
| 4.2.2.2.3   | The 'aim and effects' theory in WTO adjudication                            | 212 |
| 4.2.2.2.3.1 | <i>US – Malt Beverages</i> (1992)   | 213 |
| 4.2.2.2.3.2 | <i>US – Taxes on Automobiles</i> (1994)                                     | 214 |
| 4.2.2.2.3.3 | <i>Japan – Alcoholic Beverages</i> (1996) and <i>EC – Bananas</i> (1997)    | 215 |
| 4.2.2.2.3.4 | Subsequent jurisprudence  | 218 |
| 4.2.2.2.4   | Critique  | 220 |
| 4.2.2.3     | Market-based or economic approaches   | 222 |
| 4.2.2.3.1   | Rationales and main elements  | 223 |
| 4.2.2.3.2   | Significance for NPA measures   | 226 |
| 4.2.2.3.3   | Relevance in WTO adjudication   | 228 |
| 4.2.2.3.4   | Critique  | 232 |
| 4.2.3       | Summary   | 236 |
| 4.3         | Detrimental treatment and NPA measures                                      | 240 |
| 4.4         | Conclusions   | 244 |

|             |  |     |
|-------------|--|-----|
| 5           | Limits to the justification of NPA measures under the general exceptions | 247 |
| 5.1         | Particularities in interpreting Article XX                               | 249 |
| 5.1.1       | Relevance of international law for interpretation                        | 249 |
| 5.1.1.1     | Basic framework of interpretation  | 250 |
| 5.1.1.2     | GATT and WTO case law  | 252 |
| 5.1.1.3     | Signatories-based approach   | 254 |
| 5.1.1.3.1   | Congruence within disputes   | 255 |
| 5.1.1.3.2   | Incongruence within disputes   | 257 |
| 5.1.1.4     | Objective approach   | 258 |
| 5.1.1.4.1   | The nature of interpretation   | 258 |
| 5.1.1.4.2   | Relevance of international instruments                                   | 260 |
| 5.1.1.4.3   | Summary  | 263 |
| 5.1.1.4.4   | Excursus: <i>inter se</i> understanding on interpretation                | 264 |
| 5.1.2       | Other interpretative questions   | 265 |
| 5.1.2.1     | No restrictive interpretation  | 265 |
| 5.1.2.2     | Static or evolutionary interpretation?                                   | 267 |
| 5.1.3       | Summary  | 269 |
| 5.2         | General concerns regarding justifiability of NPA measures                | 269 |
| 5.2.1       | Vagueness of basic objections  | 270 |
| 5.2.2       | Review of arguments against justifiability                               | 272 |
| 5.2.2.1     | Irreconcilability with WTO objectives and purpose                        | 272 |
| 5.2.2.2     | <i>Per se</i> violation of the chapeau                                   | 274 |
| 5.2.2.3     | Violation of the sovereignty principle                                   | 275 |
| 5.2.3       | Result   | 281 |
| 5.3         | The scope of Article XX  | 281 |
| 5.3.1       | The geographical scope and the problem of extraterritoriality            | 281 |
| 5.3.1.1     | Insufficient GATT and WTO case law                                       | 283 |
| 5.3.1.2     | The text of the particular exceptions                                    | 284 |
| 5.3.1.2.1   | Direct references to the geographical scope                              | 285 |
| 5.3.1.2.2   | Indirect reference: the means–end relationship                           | 286 |
| 5.3.1.2.2.1 | ‘necessary’  | 286 |
| 5.3.1.2.2.2 | ‘relating to’ and ‘imposed for’  | 288 |
| 5.3.1.2.2.3 | Implications for the geographical scope                                  | 291 |
| 5.3.1.2.3   | Indirect reference in exception (g): domestic restrictions               | 295 |
| 5.3.1.2.3.1 | History and relevant case law  | 295 |
| 5.3.1.2.3.2 | Distinction between foreign and shared resources                         | 297 |
| 5.3.1.3     | Object and purpose   | 300 |
| 5.3.1.4     | Negotiating history  | 302 |
| 5.3.1.5     | Alternative approaches to extraterritoriality                            | 305 |
| 5.3.1.6     | Conclusions on the geographical scope                                    | 308 |
| 5.3.2       | Subject coverage of the particular exceptions                            | 309 |
| 5.3.2.1     | Exclusivity of listed policies   | 310 |

|             |  |     |
|-------------|--|-----|
| 5.3.2.2     | Coverage of other policies   | 311 |
| 5.3.2.2.1   | Protection of the environment  | 311 |
| 5.3.2.2.2   | Human rights and labour standards  | 313 |
| 5.3.2.3     | Summary  | 316 |
| 5.3.3       | Special consideration of the public morals exception                     | 316 |
| 5.3.3.1     | Open subject coverage  | 317 |
| 5.3.3.2     | Standards of right and wrong   | 321 |
| 5.3.3.3     | The geographical scope   | 323 |
| 5.3.3.3.1   | Location of moral standards  | 323 |
| 5.3.3.3.2   | Location of the threat   | 324 |
| 5.3.3.3.3   | Preliminary conclusions  | 326 |
| 5.3.3.4     | Requirements relating to the means–end relationship                      | 326 |
| 5.3.3.4.1   | Motivation for moral NPA trade measures                                  | 327 |
| 5.3.3.4.2   | Suitability  | 328 |
| 5.3.3.4.3   | Necessity  | 329 |
| 5.3.3.4.3.1 | ‘Relative’ and ‘absolute’ necessity                                      | 330 |
| 5.3.3.4.3.2 | WTO jurisprudence on ‘weighing and balancing’                            | 331 |
| 5.3.3.4.3.3 | Other approaches   | 338 |
| 5.3.3.4.4   | Conclusions for an adequate ‘necessity’ test                             | 339 |
| 5.3.3.4.4.1 | Step 1   | 340 |
| 5.3.3.4.4.2 | Step 2   | 341 |
| 5.3.3.4.4.3 | Step 3   | 342 |
| 5.3.4       | Summary  | 343 |
| 5.4         | The chapeau and other requirements regarding the application of measures | 345 |
| 5.4.1       | A ‘balancing process’ under the chapeau?                                 | 347 |
| 5.4.2       | The requirements   | 349 |
| 5.4.2.1     | Introductory remarks   | 350 |
| 5.4.2.2     | General requirements and principles                                      | 352 |
| 5.4.2.2.1   | An ‘unavoidable’ standard of justifiability?                             | 352 |
| 5.4.2.2.2   | Relevance of different conditions in countries                           | 353 |
| 5.4.2.2.3   | Special and differential treatment                                       | 356 |
| 5.4.2.2.3.1 | The principle of SDT   | 356 |
| 5.4.2.2.3.2 | Relevance of SDT for the chapeau   | 359 |
| 5.4.2.2.4   | Due process and general principles                                       | 359 |
| 5.4.2.3     | Specific problem fields  | 361 |
| 5.4.2.3.1   | No prohibition of unilateral measures                                    | 361 |
| 5.4.2.3.2   | Are serious negotiations obligatory?                                     | 362 |
| 5.4.2.4     | Specific requirements for NPA measures                                   | 364 |
| 5.4.2.4.1   | Relevant characteristics of NPA measures                                 | 365 |
| 5.4.2.4.2   | Consultations and negotiations   | 366 |
| 5.4.2.4.3   | Implementation periods   | 367 |
| 5.4.2.4.4   | Transfer of technologies, administrative and financial support           | 369 |
| 5.5         | Conclusions  | 372 |

|             |  |            |
|-------------|--|------------|
| 6           | The status of PPM measures under the TBT Agreement and the SPS Agreement                                 | 374        |
| 6.1         | Introduction   | 374        |
| 6.2         | The TBT Agreement and PPMs   | 374        |
| 6.2.1       | Applicability of the TBT Agreement   | 375        |
| 6.2.1.1     | Categorization of relevant norms linked to unincorporated PPMs   | 376        |
| 6.2.1.2     | Technical regulations and standards  | 377        |
| 6.2.1.3     | Labelling requirements   | 381        |
| 6.2.1.3.1   | The EU regulatory framework on egg labelling   | 383        |
| 6.2.1.3.2   | Coverage with respect to labelling of PPMs and NPAs  | 385        |
| 6.2.1.3.2.1 | Labelling of unincorporated PPMs   | 385        |
| 6.2.1.3.2.2 | Other NPAs   | 388        |
| 6.2.2       | Substantive provisions   | 389        |
| 6.2.2.1     | No <i>per se</i> illegality  | 389        |
| 6.2.2.2     | Substantive requirements on technical regulations and standards  | 393        |
| 6.2.2.2.1   | Overview of substantive requirements   | 393        |
| 6.2.2.2.2   | The distinction between regulations and standards  | 395        |
| 6.2.2.3     | Legitimacy of the objective pursued: special consideration of consumer information                       | 396        |
| 6.2.2.3.1   | Consumer information as an internationally recognized value  | 398        |
| 6.2.2.3.2   | Consumer information as precondition for the functioning of markets                                      | 405        |
| 6.2.2.3.3   | Preliminary conclusions  | 410        |
| 6.2.2.4     | Necessity  | 412        |
| 6.2.3       | The relationship of the TBT Agreement and the GATT   | 414        |
| 6.2.4       | Special and differential treatment   | 415        |
| 6.3         | The SPS Agreement  | 419        |
| 6.4         | Result   | 421        |
| III         | <b>Outlook: new perspectives on the legal status of NPA measures</b>                                     | <b>423</b> |
| 7           | The interface of international trade and public policies: an overview over existing proposals for reform | 427        |
| 7.1         | Review   | 427        |
| 7.1.1       | Denial of competence?  | 428        |
| 7.1.2       | Changes at WTO level   | 432        |
| 7.1.2.1     | Substance  | 433        |
| 7.1.2.2     | Procedure  | 438        |
| 7.1.3       | Institutional changes and governance-related suggestions   | 440        |

|         |   |     |  |
|---------|---|-----|--|
| 7.1.3.1 | Institutional changes   | 440 |  |
| 7.1.3.2 | Governance in a multi-level system  | 443 |  |
| 7.2     | Comment   | 448 |  |
| 8       | A regulation-based perspective on NPA trade measures                            | 451 |  |
| 8.1     | Regulatory problems linked to international trade                               | 452 |  |
| 8.1.1   | Side-effects of international trade   | 453 |  |
| 8.1.2   | The regulatory dilemma  | 454 |  |
| 8.1.2.1 | Effectiveness of unimpaired national regulation                                 | 454 |  |
| 8.1.2.2 | Effectiveness of impaired national regulation                                   | 456 |  |
| 8.1.3   | Market failure and the lack of international institutions                       | 461 |  |
| 8.1.4   | Regulatory failure is not in line with objectives and key rationales of the WTO | 463 |  |
| 8.1.5   | Conclusions   | 466 |  |
| 8.2     | Applying the regulation-based perspective                                       | 467 |  |
| 8.2.1   | Deduction of the regulation-based approach                                      | 467 |  |
| 8.2.2   | Categorization of national regulation   | 469 |  |
| 8.2.2.1 | Category 1: Regulation reducing market imperfections                            | 469 |  |
| 8.2.2.2 | Category 2: Regulation addressing market failure                                | 473 |  |
| 8.2.2.3 | Category 3: Distributive regulation   | 478 |  |
| 8.2.3   | General conditions of consistency   | 481 |  |
| 8.2.3.1 | General requirements  | 481 |  |
| 8.2.3.2 | National regulation and SDT   | 482 |  |
| 8.2.4   | Conclusions   | 483 |  |
|         | <i>Summary and concluding remarks</i>   | 485 |  |
|         | <i>Bibliography</i>   | 494 |  |
|         | <i>Index</i>  | 513 |  |