

# Contents

## Part I Establishing the VAT and Financial Supplies Benchmarks

<b>1 Theories of Consumption and the Consequences of Partial Taxation of Financial Services</b> . . . . .	3
Robert F. van Brederode and Richard Krever	
1.1 The Concept of Consumption . . . . .	4
1.2 The Consequences of Partial Taxation of Financial Services . . .	7
1.2.1 Mixed and Composite Supplies . . . . .	8
1.2.2 Change of Use . . . . .	9
1.2.3 Sale of Used Business Assets . . . . .	9
1.2.4 Input Tax Allocation . . . . .	10
1.3 The Challenge . . . . .	11
References . . . . .	11

## Part II Loans and Intermediary Services

<b>2 Taxing Loan Intermediary Services: Theory and Design Considerations</b> . . . . .	15
Robert F. van Brederode and Richard Krever	
2.1 Introduction . . . . .	15
2.2 Characterizing Loan Principal, Interest and Loan Intermediary Services for VAT Purposes . . . . .	16
2.2.1 Loan Principal . . . . .	16
2.2.2 Interest . . . . .	16
2.2.3 Loan Intermediary Services . . . . .	18
2.3 Alternative Methods of Taxing Financial Services . . . . .	20
2.3.1 Treating Financial Services as Exempt Supplies . . . . .	20
2.3.2 Recharacterizing Loans as Ordinary Business Supplies . . . . .	22
2.3.3 Limited Input Tax Credits for Financial Loan Service Suppliers . . . . .	23

2.3.4	Zero-Rating . . . . .	24
2.3.5	Addition Method . . . . .	25
2.3.6	Subtraction Method . . . . .	26
2.3.7	Cash Flow Method . . . . .	26
2.3.8	Modified Reverse Charge . . . . .	29
2.4	Summary, Conclusions, and Policy Objectives . . . . .	31
	References. . . . .	32
<b>3</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: Argentina. . . . .</b>	<b>35</b>
	Guillermo Teijeiro	
3.1	General Description . . . . .	36
3.1.1	Legal Framework . . . . .	36
3.1.2	VAT Scope: Financial Supplies—Loan Intermediary Services. . . . .	36
3.1.3	Tax Point. . . . .	37
3.1.4	Place of Supply or Equivalent. . . . .	37
3.1.5	Chargeable Amount: Valuation . . . . .	38
3.1.6	Tax Rate . . . . .	39
3.1.7	Exempt Supplies or Equivalent . . . . .	39
3.1.8	Deduction and Recovery of Input Tax. . . . .	40
3.1.9	State, Provincial or Local Indirect Taxes. . . . .	41
3.2	Account Fees . . . . .	42
3.3	ATM Fees . . . . .	42
3.4	Credit Card Purchase Surcharges . . . . .	42
3.5	Facilitators of Loans . . . . .	43
3.6	Finance Leases . . . . .	43
3.6.1	Tax Point. . . . .	44
3.6.2	Special Exemption. . . . .	44
3.6.3	Leasing of Motor Vehicles . . . . .	44
3.6.4	VAT Financing . . . . .	45
3.6.5	Optional Regime to Offset Output VAT in Advance . . . . .	45
3.6.6	Leasing Contracts on Real Estate . . . . .	46
3.6.7	Leaseback Transactions. . . . .	47
3.7	Non-financial Services that Might Be Deemed to be Financial . . . . .	48
3.7.1	Safe Deposit Boxes . . . . .	48
3.7.2	Implicit and Explicit Loans in the Course of Business . . . . .	48
3.8	Gross Income Tax . . . . .	49
	References. . . . .	49

<b>4</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: Australia</b> .....	51
	Richard Krever and Jonathan Teoh	
4.1	Introduction .....	51
4.2	What Are Financial Supplies? .....	53
	4.2.1 The Definition of Financial Supplies .....	53
	4.2.2 Credit Card Surcharges .....	56
4.3	Recovery of Input Tax by Financial Suppliers .....	57
	4.3.1 The General Apportionment Rule .....	57
	4.3.2 The <i>de Minimis</i> Exception to Apportionment .....	57
	4.3.3 The ‘Acquisition Supply’ .....	58
	4.3.4 Borrowing-Related Costs .....	60
4.4	Reduced Input Tax Credits .....	61
4.5	Imported Services Provided to Enterprises Making Financial Supplies .....	63
4.6	Exported Financial Supplies .....	63
4.7	Reform Recommendations .....	64
	References .....	64
<b>5</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: Brazil</b> .....	67
	Flavio Rubinstein	
5.1	Introduction .....	68
5.2	Federal VAT Taxation of Financial Services .....	72
	5.2.1 Federal Taxation of Gross Revenues: PIS and COFINS .....	72
	5.2.2 PIS and COFINS Levies on Financial Institutions .....	73
	5.2.3 PIS and COFINS Levies for Non-financial Institutions .....	75
	5.2.4 Inbound and Outbound Financial Services .....	78
5.3	Sub-national VAT Taxation of Financial Services .....	78
	5.3.1 National Framework .....	78
	5.3.2 National Rules for the Taxation of Financial Services .....	81
	References .....	86
<b>6</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: Canada</b> .....	87
	Simon Thang	
6.1	Overview .....	87
6.2	Lending in General .....	88
	6.2.1 Introduction .....	88
	6.2.2 Exclusions from ‘Financial Service’ .....	92
	6.2.3 ‘Arranging For’ Financial Services .....	95
	6.2.4 Credit Card Surcharges .....	98
	6.2.5 Loans in the Course of Business .....	99
	6.2.6 <i>De Minimis</i> Financial Institutions .....	101

6.2.7	Input Tax Credits	103
6.3	Self-assessment Requirements	105
6.4	Special Attribution Method for Provincial Tax	107
	Reference	108
<b>7</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: China</b>	<b>109</b>
	Na Li and Richard Krever	
7.1	Introduction	109
7.2	Scope of Loan Intermediary Services in China	111
7.3	The Former Business Tax Regime	112
7.4	The Current VAT Regime	114
	7.4.1 Explicit Loans	115
	7.4.2 Implicit Loans	116
	7.4.3 Timing Issues	118
	7.4.4 A Lost Opportunity	119
7.5	Exported Loan Intermediary Services	119
7.6	Tax Administration	120
7.7	Summary	121
	References	121
<b>8</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: European Union</b>	<b>123</b>
	Joachim Englisch	
8.1	Legal Framework	123
8.2	Treatment of Financial Sector Loan Intermediary Services	125
	8.2.1 General Approach: Exemption Without Credit	125
	8.2.2 Scope of the Exemption in the Case of Core Lending Activities	127
	8.2.3 Exemption of Ancillary Activities	130
	8.2.4 Services Related to Credit Cards	131
	8.2.5 Exemption of Outsourced Activities	132
	8.2.6 Apportionment Formula for Input Tax Credits	134
8.3	Direct Loans in the Course of Business	135
	8.3.1 Treatment as a Separate or Merely Ancillary Supply	135
	8.3.2 Apportionment Formula for Input Tax Credits	137
	References	137
<b>9</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: Israel</b>	<b>139</b>
	David Goldman	
9.1	Introduction	139
9.2	The Case for Imposing Wage and Profit Tax on Financial Institutions	141
9.3	The Financial Institution Classification	143
	9.3.1 The Legal Definition	143
	9.3.2 Commercial Banks	143

9.3.3	Insurer . . . . .	144
9.3.4	A Category of Persons Designated by the Minister of Finance . . . . .	145
9.3.5	Classification According to Section 58 . . . . .	147
9.3.6	In Conclusion . . . . .	150
9.4	The Application of VAT. . . . .	150
9.5	The Application of Wage and Profit Tax . . . . .	152
9.5.1	Wage Tax . . . . .	152
9.5.2	Profit Tax . . . . .	154
9.5.3	Cross-Border Distortions . . . . .	155
9.6	Conclusion . . . . .	156
	References. . . . .	157
<b>10</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: New Zealand</b> . . . . .	<b>159</b>
	Marie Pallot and Thomas Allen	
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	159
10.2	History of New Zealand's GST Treatment of Financial Services . . . . .	160
10.3	GST Treatment of Loan Intermediary Services Under New Zealand's Goods and Services Tax Act . . . . .	161
10.4	The Scope of the Exempt Treatment of Loan Intermediary Services . . . . .	163
10.5	Business-to-Business Zero-Rating of Loan Intermediary Services . . . . .	165
10.6	Imported Services and the Reverse Charge. . . . .	167
<b>11</b>	<b>Loan Intermediary Services: South Africa</b> . . . . .	<b>169</b>
	Alwyn de Koker and Gerhard Badenhorst	
11.1	Introduction . . . . .	170
11.2	The Legal Framework. . . . .	171
11.2.1	Loan Intermediation. . . . .	176
11.2.2	Finance Leases and Rentals. . . . .	177
11.2.3	Fees and Charges . . . . .	178
11.2.4	Ancillary Activities . . . . .	179
11.2.5	Outsourced Activities . . . . .	180
11.2.6	Apportionment for Loan Intermediaries. . . . .	180
11.2.7	Reverse Charges . . . . .	183
11.2.8	Direct Loan Services . . . . .	184
11.2.9	Apportionment for Input Tax—Direct Loan Services . . . . .	185

**Part III Financial Investments**

<b>12</b>	<b>VAT and Financial Investments</b> . . . . .	189
	Richard Krever	
12.1	Introduction . . . . .	189
12.2	Acquiring and Issuing Investments . . . . .	190
12.3	Investments by Unregistered Individuals . . . . .	191
12.4	Enterprises and Investments . . . . .	193
12.5	Establishing a Benchmark . . . . .	196
	References . . . . .	197
<b>13</b>	<b>VAT and Cost Sharing in the EU</b> . . . . .	199
	Ine Lejeune, Joost Vermeer and Simon Cornielje	
13.1	Introduction . . . . .	199
13.2	Impact of VAT in the Financial Services Industry . . . . .	200
13.3	Cost Sharing or Cost Allocation as a Taxable Supply . . . . .	201
	13.3.1 Supply . . . . .	202
	13.3.2 For Consideration . . . . .	203
	13.3.3 Reciprocal Performance and Cost Allocation . . . . .	204
	13.3.4 Conclusion . . . . .	207
13.4	Cost Sharing Provisions in the VAT Directive . . . . .	207
	13.4.1 VAT Grouping . . . . .	207
	13.4.2 Cost Sharing Exemption . . . . .	209
	13.4.3 Cost Sharing Exemption Implemented in the Various Countries . . . . .	217
13.5	Specific Examples of Cost Sharing Out of Scope of VAT in Certain Member States . . . . .	218
	13.5.1 The Netherlands . . . . .	218
	13.5.2 Belgium . . . . .	218
13.6	Conclusions and Policy Recommendations . . . . .	220
	13.6.1 Clear and Definitive Guidance Required on Cost Sharing Exemption . . . . .	220
	13.6.2 Cross-Border VAT Grouping . . . . .	221
	13.6.3 Review of the Treatment of Financial Services . . . . .	221
	References . . . . .	222
<b>14</b>	<b>A VAT/GST Perspective on Crowdfunding</b> . . . . .	223
	Sebastian Pfeiffer	
14.1	Introduction . . . . .	223
14.2	Non-financial Return Models . . . . .	225
	14.2.1 General Remarks . . . . .	225
	14.2.2 Donation-Based Crowdfunding . . . . .	226
	14.2.3 Reward-Based Crowdfunding . . . . .	226
14.3	Financial Return Models . . . . .	227
	14.3.1 General Remarks . . . . .	227

14.3.2	Equity Models . . . . .	228
14.3.3	Lending Models . . . . .	229
14.4	Jurisdictional Examples . . . . .	229
14.4.1	EU Perspective . . . . .	229
14.4.2	South African Perspective . . . . .	239
14.4.3	Australian Perspective . . . . .	243
14.4.4	Canadian Perspective . . . . .	246
14.4.5	New Zealand Perspective . . . . .	249
14.5	Summary and Conclusions . . . . .	252
	References . . . . .	254
<b>15</b>	<b>Financial Investments: European Union . . . . .</b>	<b>257</b>
	Joachim Englisch	
15.1	Legal Framework and Overview . . . . .	257
15.2	Equity Instruments . . . . .	259
15.2.1	Instruments Covered by the Exemption . . . . .	259
15.2.2	Equity Instruments: Exempt Supplies v. Out-of-Scope Activities . . . . .	261
15.2.3	Derogations from the Exemption . . . . .	266
15.2.4	Input VAT Deduction . . . . .	267
15.2.5	Other Transactions ‘in’ Equity Interests . . . . .	269
15.3	Debt and Hybrid Instruments . . . . .	270
15.3.1	Investments Covered by Exemptions . . . . .	270
15.3.2	Debt and Hybrid Instruments: Exempt Supplies v. Out-of-Scope Activities . . . . .	272
15.4	Derivatives . . . . .	274
15.4.1	Scope of Analysis . . . . .	274
15.4.2	Lack of Guidance at EU Level . . . . .	275
15.4.3	Creation of the Derivatives Contract: A Taxable Event? . . . . .	276
15.4.4	Terminating or Settling a Derivatives Position: A Taxable Event? . . . . .	280
15.4.5	Scope of Relevant Exemptions . . . . .	281
15.4.6	Input VAT Deduction . . . . .	287
15.5	Collective Investment Vehicles . . . . .	288
15.5.1	Exempt Supplies v. Out-of-Scope Investments . . . . .	289
15.5.2	Scope of the Exemption for Trade in CIV Units . . . . .	289
15.5.3	Exemption of the Management of Special Investment Funds . . . . .	291
15.5.4	Input VAT Deduction . . . . .	292
15.6	Portfolio Management and Other Ancillary Services . . . . .	293
15.7	Input VAT Deduction of the Investor . . . . .	296
15.7.1	Overview and Summary . . . . .	296
15.7.2	Incidental Financial Transactions and Deductible Pro Rata . . . . .	297

15.7.3	Pro Rata Calculation in Case of Out-of-Scope Investment Activities . . . . .	297
	References. . . . .	298
<b>16</b>	<b>Financial Investments: South Africa</b> . . . . .	<b>301</b>
	Alwyn de Koker and Gerhard Badenhorst	
16.1	Shares . . . . .	302
16.2	Securities Lending . . . . .	305
16.3	Debentures and Debts . . . . .	306
16.4	Collective Investment Schemes . . . . .	309
16.5	Derivatives . . . . .	310
16.6	Long-Term Insurance Policies . . . . .	311
16.7	Ancillary Services . . . . .	312
16.8	Input Tax . . . . .	313
 <b>Part IV Financial Pooling Services: Insurance and Gambling</b>		
<b>17</b>	<b>GST and Insurance: Australia</b> . . . . .	<b>319</b>
	Richard Krever and Jonathan Teoh	
17.1	Introduction . . . . .	319
17.2	Unregistered Persons . . . . .	320
17.2.1	In-Kind Settlements . . . . .	321
17.2.2	Cash Settlements . . . . .	322
17.2.3	Subrogation, Excess (or ‘Deductible’) Amounts and Ex Gratia Payments . . . . .	324
17.3	Registered Persons . . . . .	325
17.3.1	Registered Persons: The Initial System . . . . .	326
17.3.2	Registered Persons: The Current System . . . . .	327
17.3.3	Insurance Provided Through Independent Agents . . . . .	330
17.4	Reinsurance (Domestic Reinsurer) . . . . .	332
17.5	Compulsory Third-Party Insurance . . . . .	332
17.6	Cross-Border Insurance . . . . .	333
17.6.1	Offshore Insurers . . . . .	333
17.6.2	Registered Suppliers Providing Insurance for Offshore Risks . . . . .	334
17.7	Life Insurance and Health Insurance . . . . .	334
	References. . . . .	335
<b>18</b>	<b>VAT and Insurance: The European Union</b> . . . . .	<b>337</b>
	Marta Papis-Almansa	
18.1	Introduction . . . . .	337
18.2	EU Exemption Model . . . . .	339
18.3	Purpose of the Exemption for Insurance . . . . .	341
18.4	The Scope of the Exemption: Interpretative Difficulties . . . . .	342
18.5	The ‘Essentials of an Insurance Transaction’: The <i>CPP</i> Decision and a Block Insurance Policy . . . . .	344



18.6	The Nature of a Service Is Decisive: <i>Commission v. Greece</i> and Road Assistance Services . . . . .	347
18.7	A Contractual Relationship: <i>Skandia</i> and Administrative Services . . . . .	348
18.8	Agents and Brokers Being ‘No More Than Intermediaries’: <i>Taksatorringen</i> and Damage Assessment . . . . .	349
18.9	Outsourced Activities with No Risk Assumption Are Outside the Scope of Exemption: <i>Arthur Andersen</i> and Back-Office Services . . . . .	351
18.10	Indirect Contractual Relationship: <i>Beheer</i> and Services of Sub-agents . . . . .	352
18.11	(Re)strict(ive) Interpretation: <i>Swiss Re</i> and Transfer of a Portfolio of Reinsurance Contracts . . . . .	353
18.12	‘Re-invoicing’ of the Exact Cost of Insurance Is Exempt: <i>BGŻ Leasing</i> and Insurance Provided Together with Leasing . . . . .	354
18.13	Substance Over Form: <i>Mapfre</i> and Extended Warranties . . . . .	356
18.14	An Impact of the Commission’s Proposal on the Existing Case Law: <i>Aspiro</i> and Claim Settlement Activities . . . . .	359
18.15	Conclusions . . . . .	361
	References . . . . .	363
<b>19</b>	<b>GST and Insurance: Singapore</b> . . . . .	<b>365</b>
	Soo How Koh and Rushan Lee	
19.1	Introduction . . . . .	365
19.2	Life Insurance . . . . .	366
19.3	General Insurance . . . . .	368
19.4	Agents, Broking and Intermediary Services . . . . .	368
19.5	Reinsurance . . . . .	369
19.6	Deemed Input Tax on Cash Payments . . . . .	369
	19.6.1 Recovery of Part or Whole of Cash Payment . . . . .	370
	19.6.2 Ex Gratia . . . . .	370
19.7	Input Tax on Motor Vehicle Expenses . . . . .	370
19.8	Input Tax Recovery Formula . . . . .	371
	References . . . . .	372
<b>20</b>	<b>VAT and Gambling</b> . . . . .	<b>373</b>
	Fabiola Annacondia and Laura Mattes Alonso	
20.1	Introduction . . . . .	373
20.2	Definitions . . . . .	375
20.3	How to Impose VAT on Gambling Transactions: <i>Exemption v. Taxation</i> . . . . .	377
	20.3.1 EU VAT System . . . . .	377
	20.3.2 Modern VAT Systems . . . . .	381

20.4	Gambling Services Provided Through the Internet . . . . .	386
20.4.1	The Rise of Online Gambling . . . . .	386
20.4.2	How Should VAT Be Imposed on e-Gambling Transactions? . . . . .	389
20.5	Conclusions . . . . .	394
	References. . . . .	397
	<b>Table of Case Law . . . . .</b>	<b>399</b>