

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xliii</i>
<i>Table of Statutory Instruments</i>	<i>lix</i>
<i>Table of European Materials</i>	<i>lxi</i>
<i>Table of International Conventions and Instruments</i>	<i>lxiii</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>lxv</i>

## **1** INTRODUCTION TO FAMILY LAW 1

---

1.1 Families and family law in England and Wales today	1
1.1.1 What is 'family'?	1
1.1.2 What is family law?	2
1.2 Themes and issues in contemporary family law	3
1.2.1 A rights-based approach to the family?	3
1.2.2 Rules versus discretion	10
1.2.3 State intervention versus private ordering	12
1.2.4 Gender issues	13
1.2.5 Sexual orientation	17
1.2.6 Cultural diversity	18
1.2.7 Should law and lawyers keep out of the family?	21
1.3 Concluding thoughts	25

## **2** FAMILY RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN ADULTS 27

---

2.1 Introduction	27
2.2 Family relationships in England and Wales	29
2.3 Gender and sexual orientation	31
2.3.1 Determining gender: transgender and inter-sex people	32
2.3.2 Same-sex relationships	37
2.4 Status-based relationships: marriage and civil partnership	55
2.4.1 The nature of marriage and civil partnership	55
2.4.2 The significance of status	57
2.4.3 A right to marry, or not to marry?	59

2.5	Creating a valid marriage or civil partnership	61
2.5.1	The law of nullity: void, voidable, and non-marriages	61
2.5.2	The practical importance of the law of nullity	63
2.5.3	Formal requirements for creating marriage and civil partnership	63
2.6	Grounds on which a marriage or civil partnership is void	65
2.6.1	Capacity to marry or form a civil partnership	65
2.6.2	Disregard of formal requirements	73
2.7	Grounds on which a marriage or civil partnership is voidable	78
2.7.1	Lack of valid consent	79
2.7.2	Mental disorder rendering person ‘unfit’ for marriage or civil partnership	90
2.7.3	The respondent was pregnant by another at the time of the ceremony	91
2.7.4	Grounds relating to gender recognition	91
2.7.5	Grounds unique to marriage: the sexual nature of marriage	92
2.7.6	The case of consummation: a critique of marriage and civil partnership	96
2.8	Non-formalized relationships: cohabitants and other ‘family’	99
2.8.1	Identifying ‘family’	101
2.8.2	Cohabitants	106
2.8.3	The platonic, non-conjugal family	111
2.9	Conclusion	116

### **3** FAMILY PROPERTY AND FINANCES 117

---

3.1	Introduction	117
3.2	The social context	119
3.2.1	The family home	119
3.2.2	The family economy	120
3.3	Family property systems: separate property	122
3.3.1	The old law of husband and wife	122
3.3.2	Reform: separate property and separate liability for spouses	123
3.4	The current law: ascertaining ownership of land	125
3.4.1	Transfers and express trusts: formal requirements	125
3.4.2	Implied trusts of land and proprietary estoppel: introduction	128
3.4.3	Implied trusts of land: the presumptions of resulting trust and advancement	128
3.4.4	Implied trusts: ‘common intention’ constructive trusts	130
3.4.5	Proprietary estoppel	147
3.4.6	Improvement to property by spouse or civil partner	149
3.4.7	Criticisms of the current law relating to ownership of land	149
3.5	The current law: ascertaining ownership of other property	160

3.6	Family property systems: options for reform	163
3.6.1	Basic questions for reform of family property law	164
3.6.2	Community of property regimes	165
3.6.3	Joint ownership of home, contents, and other assets	167
3.6.4	But is community or joint ownership appropriate?	171
3.6.5	Modified trusts law for the 'shared home'	174
3.6.6	Should we focus on 'ownership' during relationships at all?	176
3.7	Rights in relation to the family home and its contents	178
3.7.1	Rights to occupy the family home	178
3.7.2	Decision-making about sale and other transactions relating to the family home	184
3.7.3	Protecting occupation against third parties	187
3.7.4	Rights regarding the contents of the family home	187
3.8	Family finances	188
3.8.1	Private law	189
3.8.2	Families in the tax and benefit systems	192
3.9	Conclusion	201

## **4** DOMESTIC VIOLENCE 203

---

4.1	Introduction	203
4.2	Background issues: domestic violence and key policy questions	204
4.2.1	What is 'domestic violence'?	204
4.2.2	Evidence about domestic violence	205
4.2.3	Feminist critiques of domestic violence law, policy, and practice	210
4.2.4	The human rights dimension	214
4.3	The criminal law and domestic violence	219
4.3.1	The criminal law	219
4.3.2	The criminal justice system	220
4.4	The civil law and domestic violence: introduction	223
4.5	The Family Law Act 1996, Part IV	224
4.5.1	The range of relationships covered: 'associated persons'	225
4.5.2	Non-molestation orders	230
4.5.3	Occupation orders	234
4.5.4	A human rights audit of the occupation order scheme	254
4.5.5	Applications, orders, and undertakings	257
4.6	Civil remedies under the Protection from Harassment Act 1997	262
4.7	Enforcement of orders under the FLA 1996 and the PHA 1997	265
4.7.1	Occupation orders	265
4.7.2	Non-molestation orders and injunctions under the PHA 1997	268

4.7.3 Sanctions for breach in the family and civil courts	275
4.8 The future: integrating criminal, civil, and family proceedings?	279
4.9 Conclusion	281

## **5** ENDING RELATIONSHIPS: DIVORCE AND SEPARATION 283

---

5.1 Introduction	283
5.2 The rise in divorce	285
5.2.1 Divorces in England and Wales	285
5.2.2 Who divorces?	287
5.3 The nature, function, and limits of divorce law	288
5.3.1 Regulation or regularization?	288
5.3.2 Fault or 'no-fault'?	289
5.3.3 'Easier' or 'harder' divorce and supporting the institution of marriage	289
5.3.4 Can divorce law affect marital and divorcing behaviour?	290
5.3.5 A legal or non-legal approach?	291
5.4 A brief history of divorce law to 1969	291
5.5 The present law of divorce and judicial separation	293
5.5.1 The ground for divorce and dissolution: irretrievable breakdown of marriage or civil partnership	293
5.5.2 The facts: adultery by the respondent	294
5.5.3 The facts: behaviour of the respondent	297
5.5.4 The facts: desertion for two years by the respondent	304
5.5.5 The separation facts	308
5.5.6 Bars and other restrictions on divorce and dissolution	313
5.5.7 The procedure for divorce and dissolution	319
5.5.8 The facts in practice	327
5.5.9 Judicial separation	329
5.6 Evaluation of the current law	329
5.7 Options for reform of divorce law and the process of divorce	334
5.7.1 Reaffirming the centrality of fault?	335
5.7.2 Divorce by mutual consent?	339
5.7.3 Divorce on unilateral demand?	339
5.7.4 Divorce as a process over time: the FLA 1996	340
5.8 Where next for English divorce law?	345
5.8.1 The demise of the FLA 1996	345
5.8.2 Current policy initiatives surrounding relationship breakdown	347
5.9 Conclusion	348

<b>6</b>	<b>FINANCIAL AND PROPERTY PROVISION FOR CHILDREN</b>	<b>350</b>
6.1	Introduction	351
6.2	A brief history of financial provision for children	354
6.2.1	Public and private law obligations to maintain children prior to 1993	354
6.2.2	The birth, development, and demise of the Child Support Agency, 1993–2008	355
6.2.3	The birth of C-MEC	357
6.3	Overview of the current law	360
6.3.1	The parties' relationships	360
6.3.2	C-MEC or court?	361
6.4	Child support: the current law	361
6.4.1	The relevant parties	361
6.4.2	General principles	363
6.4.3	Routes to receiving child maintenance	364
6.4.4	The maintenance calculation	366
6.4.5	Variations	371
6.4.6	Termination of the calculation	375
6.4.7	Collection and enforcement of C-MEC maintenance calculations	375
6.4.8	Challenging C-MEC decisions	389
6.5	Court-based provision: the current law	391
6.5.1	Lump sum and property-related orders	391
6.5.2	Periodical payments	391
6.5.3	The statutory schemes	395
6.5.4	The grounds for orders and the courts' discretion	398
6.5.5	Principles from the case law	400
6.5.6	Enforcement of court orders	406
6.6	'Voluntary arrangements' and other private ordering	406
6.6.1	Maintenance and other financial agreements and consent orders for the benefit of children	407
6.6.2	Discouraging the 'clean break'	410
6.7	Policy questions relating to financial support of children	411
6.7.1	Children's right or parents' responsibility?	411
6.7.2	Public and private	414
6.7.3	Legal and social parenthood	419
6.7.4	The formula: cost-sharing or resource-sharing?	424
6.7.5	Rules or discretion?	426
6.7.6	Administrative or judicial forum?	428
6.8	Conclusion	429

<b>7</b>	<b>PROPERTY AND FINANCES WHEN RELATIONSHIPS END</b>	<b>431</b>
7.1	Introduction	432
7.2	The social context	432
7.3	Remedies on divorce: the orders available	434
7.3.1	Financial provision	434
7.3.2	Property adjustment and orders for sale	435
7.3.3	Orders relating to pensions	437
7.3.4	When may orders be made?	438
7.3.5	Variation of orders	438
7.3.6	Enforcement of orders	438
7.4	The principles governing the grant of relief: an introduction	439
7.4.1	A brief history	439
7.4.2	The current law: the statutory discretion	441
7.5	Exercising the statutory discretion: principles from the case law	444
7.5.1	First consideration: the welfare of the children	445
7.5.2	Meeting the parties' material needs	446
7.5.3	Compensation: relationship-generated economic disadvantage	453
7.5.4	Entitlement: equal sharing	459
7.5.5	The interaction of need, compensation, and equal sharing	475
7.5.6	The parties' conduct	478
7.6	The clean break principle	484
7.6.1	Terminating ongoing financial relations between the parties	484
7.6.2	The clean break in practice	486
7.6.3	Applications to set aside and for leave to appeal final orders	487
7.7	Private ordering	489
7.7.1	Consent orders	489
7.7.2	Separation and maintenance agreements	492
7.7.3	Post-nuptial agreements	496
7.7.4	Pre-nuptial agreements	497
7.7.5	Reform?	503
7.8	Remedies on other types of family relationship breakdown	508
7.8.1	The general law applies	509
7.8.2	Remedies for the benefit of children	509
7.8.3	Disputes regarding the former family home	509
7.8.4	Private ordering	514
7.8.5	New statutory remedies for cohabitants?	516
7.9	Conclusion	520

<b>8</b>	<b>FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES IN THE LAW RELATING TO CHILDREN</b>	<b>521</b>
<hr/>		
8.1	Introduction	521
8.2	The welfare principle	523
8.2.1	The paramountcy of the child's welfare	523
8.2.2	Criticisms of the welfare principle	528
8.3	Alternatives to the welfare principle	536
8.3.1	Re-conceptualizing the welfare principle	536
8.4	A rights-based approach to child-related disputes: taking parents' rights seriously	539
8.4.1	Establishing a 'right' under Article 8(1)	540
8.4.2	Establishing a breach of Article 8(1)	541
8.4.3	Justifying a breach under Article 8(2)	541
8.4.4	Can the paramountcy principle be reconciled with Article 8?	542
8.4.5	Summary: the impact of the HRA 1998 on child-related disputes	548
8.5	Children's rights	549
8.5.1	Are children's rights important?	549
8.5.2	The theoretical foundations of children's rights	553
8.5.3	The development of children's rights in English law	558
8.5.4	Children's rights in the courts	559
8.5.5	Children's rights and the ECHR	572
8.6	Non-intervention in private family life	574
8.7	Conclusion	580
<b>9</b>	<b>BECOMING A LEGAL PARENT AND THE CONSEQUENCES OF LEGAL PARENTHOOD</b>	<b>581</b>
<hr/>		
9.1	Introduction	582
9.2	Concepts of parenthood and possible approaches to determining legal parenthood	583
9.2.1	What is a 'parent'?	583
9.2.2	The importance of legal parenthood	585
9.2.3	Competing approaches to determining a child's legal parents	586
9.3	Determining parenthood in the context of natural reproduction	589
9.3.1	Establishing maternity	589
9.3.2	Establishing paternity	589
9.4	Determining parenthood in the context of assisted reproduction	611
9.4.1	The brave new world of assisted reproduction	611

9.4.2	Access to treatment: is parenthood a right or a privilege?	613
9.4.3	Determining parenthood under the HFEA 2008	622
9.4.4	The child's right to know his/her genetic parentage	632
9.5	Surrogacy	640
9.5.1	Early attitudes to surrogacy	640
9.5.2	The statutory framework for surrogacy	641
9.6	Adoption	651
9.7	Conclusion	651

## **10** PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITY 653

---

10.1	Introduction	654
10.2	What is parental responsibility?	655
10.2.1	From rights to responsibility	655
10.2.2	Defining parental responsibility	659
10.3	Who has parental responsibility?	660
10.3.1	Mothers	661
10.3.2	Fathers	661
10.3.3	Unmarried fathers and parental responsibility—a need for further reform or a step too far?	671
10.3.4	Second female parents under ss 42 and 43 of the HFEA 2008	682
10.3.5	Step-parents	682
10.3.6	Holders of a residence order	684
10.3.7	Special guardians	687
10.3.8	Guardians	687
10.3.9	Adoption	688
10.3.10	Local authorities	688
10.4	Exercising parental responsibility	688
10.4.1	A duty to consult or a right of unilateral action?	688
10.4.2	Limitations on the exercise of parental responsibility	695
10.5	Terminating parental responsibility	709
10.5.1	Mothers, married fathers, and second female parents under s 42 of the HFEA 2008	709
10.5.2	Unmarried fathers, second female parents under s 43 of the HFEA 2008, and step-parents	710
10.5.3	Guardians, special guardians, and others	712
10.6	Caring for children without parental responsibility	712
10.7	Conclusion	713



<b>11</b>	<b>PRIVATE DISPUTES OVER CHILDREN</b>	<b>714</b>
11.1	Introduction	715
11.2	Private law orders under the Children Act 1989	716
11.3	Procedural matters germane to all s 8 orders	716
11.3.1	When may a s 8 order be made?	716
11.3.2	Who may apply for a s 8 order?	716
11.3.3	The participation of children in private law disputes	720
11.4	Residence orders	728
11.4.1	The legal framework	728
11.4.2	A 'presumption' in favour of the mother?	728
11.4.3	Victims of gender discrimination—mothers, fathers, or both?	735
11.4.4	Other important considerations in parent versus parent disputes	737
11.4.5	Shared residence—the answer?	744
11.4.6	A 'presumption' in favour of a natural parent?	761
11.4.7	Effect of a residence order	768
11.4.8	Terminating the order	775
11.5	Contact	776
11.5.1	A 'presumption' in favour of contact with the non-resident parent?	776
11.5.2	Displacing the 'presumption'	785
11.5.3	Enforcing contact orders	794
11.5.4	Taking contact out of the courts	800
11.6	Specific issue and prohibited steps orders	801
11.7	Conclusion	802
<b>12</b>	<b>CHILD PROTECTION</b>	<b>803</b>
12.1	Introduction	803
12.2	Principles of state intervention into family life	804
12.2.1	Competing approaches and the Children Act 1989	804
12.2.2	The human rights dimension	807
12.2.3	The problem of resources	809
12.3	State support for children and families under Part III	809
12.3.1	The general duty to children in need: s 17	810
12.3.2	Providing accommodation for a child	812
12.3.3	Local authority duties with respect to looked after children	818
12.3.4	Cooperation between local authority services	821
12.3.5	Part III: a success?	822

12.4	The child protection system: investigating allegations of child abuse	822
12.4.1	Section 47 investigation	822
12.4.2	Section 37 investigation	826
12.5	Care and supervision proceedings under Part IV	827
12.5.1	Who may apply for a care or supervision order?	827
12.5.2	When may a care or supervision order be made?	828
12.5.3	The threshold criteria	830
12.5.4	The welfare stage	846
12.5.5	The care plan	851
12.5.6	Effect of a care order	859
12.5.7	Contact with a child in care	860
12.5.8	Effect of a supervision order	864
12.5.9	Leaving care	869
12.6	Emergency protection under Part V	870
12.6.1	Police protection powers	870
12.6.2	Emergency protection orders	873
12.7	Interim care and supervision orders	878
12.8	Challenging local authority decisions	884
12.8.1	Local authority complaints procedure	884
12.8.2	Judicial review	885
12.8.3	Claims under the HRA 1998	886
12.9	Conclusion	886

## **13** ADOPTION 888

---

13.1	Introduction	888
13.2	What is adoption?	890
13.3	The changing face of adoption	893
13.3.1	From childless couples and trouble-free babies...	893
13.3.2	Looked after children—does adoption offer the best solution?	895
13.3.3	Adopting children out of care—new challenges	897
13.4	ACA 2002: the core principles	901
13.4.1	The welfare principle	901
13.4.2	Parental consent	903
13.5	The adoption process	907
13.5.1	Making arrangements for the adoption of a child	907
13.5.2	Finding prospective adopters	908
13.5.3	Placing the child for adoption	916
13.5.4	The adoption application	925
13.5.5	The final hearing	926

13.6 In the best interests of the child? Controversial issues	932
13.6.1 Birth family v the 'perfect' adoptive couple	932
13.6.2 Trans-racial adoption	934
13.6.3 Step-parent adoption	941
13.6.4 Adoption by a sole natural parent	943
13.7 Post-adoption issues	945
13.7.1 Open adoption	945
13.7.2 Post-adoption support	960
13.8 Alternatives to adoption: special guardianship	963
13.9 Conclusion	968
<i>Bibliography</i>	969
<i>Index</i>	1017